

Teacher Materials

Summative Performance Task

Student Task

- **Summative Performance Task: Evidence Kit**— Build an evidence kit by selecting up to five sources that address the reasons that the U.S. treaties with the Pawnee were set up to fail.

Student Outcomes

KNOW

In the 1800s the Pawnee and the United States signed two treaties. Hardships drove the Pawnee to the treaty table, and the United States used the vulnerability of the Pawnee as an opportunity to coerce them to assimilate. Although the Pawnee did make concessions in an effort to remain in their homelands with adequate resources and protection, they did not agree to the eradication of their culture.

UNDERSTAND

Successful compromise occurs when parties come to negotiations in good faith and with the intention to pursue a fair compromise. Conflict often occurs when an imbalance of power results in one group's attempt to eliminate another group's cultural ways. Groups of people go to great lengths to preserve their cultural ways, which is why attempts at forced assimilation are typically unsuccessful.

DO

Why do some treaties fail? Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay) that addresses the reasons that the U.S. treaties with the Pawnee were set up to fail, using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources, while acknowledging competing views.

Standards**[C3 Dimension Standards]**

D1.5.9-12. Determine the kinds of sources that will be helpful in answering compelling and supporting questions, taking into consideration multiple points of view represented in the sources, the types of sources available, and the potential uses of the sources.

D4.1.9-12. Construct arguments using precise and knowledgeable claims, with evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging counterclaims and evidentiary weaknesses.

[CCSS: 9-12 Grade Specific Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1; 11-12.1: Write [construct] arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

Summative Performance Task

Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

- Return to the compelling question: *Why do some treaties fail?*
- You might briefly revisit the two supporting questions with students to refresh their understanding of key content and concepts.
- Students could reflect on the extent to which their understanding of the compelling question might have changed as they moved through the inquiry.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Summative Assessment

- At this point in the inquiry, students have examined sources that address the reasons that the U.S. treaties with the Pawnee were set up to fail. Students should see that successful compromise occurs when parties come to negotiations in good faith and with the intention to pursue a fair compromise. Conflict often occurs when an imbalance of power results on one group's attempt to eliminate another group's cultural ways. Groups of people go to great lengths to preserve their cultural ways, which is why attempts at forced assimilation are typically unsuccessful. Hardships drove the Pawnee to the treaty table, and the United States used the vulnerability of the Pawnee as an opportunity to coerce them to assimilate. Although the Pawnee did make concessions in an effort to remain in their homelands with adequate resources and protection, they did not agree to the eradication of their culture.
- Students should be expected to demonstrate the breadth of their understandings and their abilities to use evidence from multiple sources to support their claims and refute counterclaims. In this task, students construct an evidence-based argument using multiple sources to answer the compelling question: *Why do some treaties fail?*
- It is important to note that students' arguments could take a variety of forms, including a detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay. Students should construct an argument in one of these forms that addresses the compelling question and acknowledges competing views, using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical sources.
- Students' arguments will vary but could include any of the argument stems presented below. Note that students should support their arguments with specific evidence from the sources they examined in the inquiry and be prepared to acknowledge competing claims or counterarguments.

Argument Stems

Teacher TIP: *An argument stem serves as the thesis statement for students' arguments.*

- The 1833 and 1857 treaties between the Pawnee and the United States show that some treaties are destined to fail because treaties can be used as tools of coercion. The United States used the treaties to insist that the Pawnee abandon traditions that were critical to their identity, culture, and community. The Pawnee resisted U.S. officials' efforts and took actions to maintain and pass on traditional knowledge systems and practices. However, as the United States grew in power and size and the Pawnee suffered from disease, warfare, and scarcity of resources, the Pawnee became increasingly vulnerable to demands of the United States.



- Some treaties are destined to fail because of the power imbalances between nations. In the case of the United States and the Pawnee Nation, the United States had a critical power advantage and used that position to mandate that the Pawnee give up their culture and ways of life. When Pawnee leaders signed the 1833 and 1857 treaties, they gave up some of their lands in return for protection and services; however, they did not agree to give up their culture, values, and beliefs. The United States used these treaties to create incredibly challenging conditions for the Pawnee to maintain their ways of living.
- By the mid-1800s, the United States had two goals when entering into treaties with the Pawnee: to take lands and to assimilate the Pawnee to an “American” way of living. The treaties of 1833 and 1857 demonstrate that the United States attempted to use treaties as a way to coercively assimilate and relocate the Pawnee Nation. When U.S. officials saw that the Pawnee would not surrender their way of life in exchange for another culture, they intensified their efforts and further relocated the Pawnee Nation, broke legal promises, and turned their backs on their Native allies. Despite this, the Pawnee persevered and managed to maintain important cultural practices.

