

Teacher Materials

Supporting Question One: What Happened Before, During, and After the 1833 Treaty with the Pawnee?

Featured Sources

- **Source Set A:** *Before the 1833 Treaty*—Examine the causes that pushed both parties to the treaty table in 1833.
- **Source Set B:** *The 1833 Treaty*—Investigate the language of the 1833 Treaty and consider the concessions each nation made and what they guaranteed to each another.
- **Source Set C:** *After the 1833 Treaty*—Analyze the causes and effects of the failure of the 1833 Treaty.

Student Tasks

- **Resource Annotator Example**—This supporting question includes an interactive resource annotator. Students use the annotator tool to mark up each source and caption. They can use up to five pins for each source to make notes that support the themes of **disadvantages** and **desires**.
- **The 1833 Treaty**



Student Outcomes

KNOW

By the 1830s the Pawnee experienced a series of hardships often caused U.S. by policies, which drove the tribe to negotiate treaties with the United States. In the end, the Pawnee did cede some of their lands; however, they did not agree to give up their way of life.

UNDERSTAND

The Pawnee resisted assimilation and made difficult decisions in order to maintain their cultural ways. The U.S. was intent on taking American Indian lands by any means necessary, including tribal removal, coercive treaties, and forced cultural assimilation. There were significant barriers to treaty negotiations, including language barriers and differing cultural values and intentions. In the end the U.S. justified its failure to keep treaty promises by using questionable interpretations of treaty guarantees and conditions.

DO

Construct evidence-based claims about why the Treaty of 1833 failed by summarizing the perspectives of the two parties entering into the treaty and synthesizing both the treaty guarantees and concessions each of the two parties agreed to.



Standards

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D3.3.9-12. Identify evidence that draws information directly and substantively from multiple sources to detect inconsistencies in evidence in order to revise or strengthen claims.

[CCSS: 9-12 Grade Specific Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.9-10.2: Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary of how key events or ideas develop over the course of the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1.A: Introduce precise claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that establishes clear relationships among the claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.2: Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary that makes clear the relationships among the key details and ideas.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.11-12.1.A: Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences the claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.2: Determine central ideas or themes of a text and analyze their development; summarize the key supporting details and ideas.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

Supporting Question One Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

Part A—Before the Treaty

Teacher TIP: Students can summarize using either paragraph form or bulleted lists.

- Set the stage for students by having them use Part A: Before the Treaty of the ***The 1833 Treaty*** worksheet. Direct students to read the introduction to the source set *Before the Treaty* and analyze both viewpoints. Then ask them to summarize the disadvantages that led the Pawnee to the treaty table and what the United States desired from a treaty with the Pawnee.
- Students can also use the annotator tool to highlight examples of Pawnee disadvantages and U.S. desires shown in the sources by typing explanations that describe why the source shows evidence of either/both themes.

Teacher TIP: Students can print or download and save their annotations as they review each source.

Pawnee Disadvantages	U.S. Desires
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Pawnee faced conflict from rival tribes that were pushed into Pawnee lands. • Smallpox killed about half of the Pawnee people. This made the Pawnee vulnerable to both settlers moving west and rival tribes. • As white settlers arrived and moved west the buffalo population decreased, making it difficult for tribes to sustain themselves. 	<p>The U.S. wanted to take American Indian lands, remove Native Nations to reservations, and assimilate tribes to the white American way of life. As more settlers began to move west, the U.S. wanted to ensure that they had enough land to settle. In order to achieve this, the U.S. pushed rival tribes closer and closer together, often causing tribal conflict. In order to mediate conflict between the Pawnee and rival tribes, the U.S. wanted to acquire a large portion of Pawnee lands to turn into communal hunting areas for all tribes displaced by the federal removal policy. In addition, the U.S. wanted to see if it could assimilate the Pawnee, and then other tribes, by employing strategies of cultural domination. The U.S. attempted to assimilate the Pawnee by employing missionaries for religious conversion and convincing the Pawnee that they would have to become farmers because of elimination of the buffalo by white settlers and sometimes intentional strategies of the U.S. government to deplete buffalo populations.</p>

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Part B—During the Treaty

Teacher TIP: In order to prime students for this task it might be helpful to discuss age-appropriate negotiations or compromises, highlighting that parties involved in negotiations sometimes have to agree to compromises, or to give up certain desires in order to get something else they might need.

- By completing Part A of the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet, students will have some context for understanding the language within the 1833 Treaty. After students examine the sources in the source set *The 1833 Treaty*, have them separate the information into two categories in Part B of the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet: treaty guarantees and treaty concessions.

	Treaty Guarantees	Treaty Concessions
U.S.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The U.S. gets a tract of land to establish common hunting grounds for displaced tribes. • The U.S. gets to decide how and when to provide funds and guarantees to the Pawnee. • The U.S. is able to educate the Pawnee towards white Western values and ways of life. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The U.S. has to bear the cost of materials and people to educate the Pawnee and teach them how to farm.
Pawnee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Pawnee get \$1,000 per year for ten years for schools and the U.S. will provide teachers. • Each band gets four farmers and each farmer gets \$1,000 worth of oxen and farm animals. • Each band gets one horse mill for grinding corn. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Pawnee cede lands for common hunting grounds. • The Pawnee have to move to a designated area and live there for one year. • The Pawnee will protect the teachers, farmers, and mill. • The Pawnee must allow the U.S. to decide when and how to distribute the guarantees.

Preview

Part B—During the Treaty

- After students complete the exercise in Part B of the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet, ask the class to consider conditions that might push one party to give up more than they would like to. Have the class consider whether both parties came to the treaty table on equal ground. If one party had an advantage over the other, ask students to apply this type of uneven negotiation to their own experiences. This discussion will prepare students to consider how desperation often pushes parties to agree to things they might not generally agree to, such as ceding lands or agreeing to give up certain rights.

Check for Understanding

Part C—Coming to Conclusions

- Go back to the introduction of the source set *The 1833 Treaty* and have students come to a conclusion in Part C of the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet about the most significant barrier to treaty negotiations. The excerpt reads, “One challenge for the Pawnee was the language barrier. No U.S. official spoke the Pawnee language and no Pawnee leader spoke English. Instead, the two parties had to communicate through three different languages: English → French → Pawnee → French → English.”
- Highlight language as the most significant barrier to treaty negotiations. The variety of translations of treaty articles not only disadvantaged the Pawnee during the 1833 Treaty, but also this practice significantly disadvantaged many other tribes during treaty negotiations. Language barriers coupled with different cultural values and negotiation protocols often advantaged the U.S. while disadvantaging Native Nations.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Part D—After the Treaty

- After reviewing all of the sources, have students construct evidence-based claims about why the 1833 Treaty with the Pawnee failed. Students construct two claims and select three pieces of evidence from the source sets to support each claim.

Check for Understanding

- Events result from multiple causes. On the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet students are analyzing the causality of the failure of the 1833 Treaty. As an extension you can have students map causality by dividing the causes into three categories: root causes (those that happen in the beginning), such as differing cultural values or language barriers; causes that build up over time (those that get progressively worse as time goes on), such as the encroachment by white settlers; and final causes (those that happen right before the event), such as the Sioux attack at Willow Creek.

Preview

- Preview the next supporting question by asking students why the Pawnee might choose to once again negotiate a treaty with the United States. Have students consider the forces that pushed the Pawnee to the treaty-making table in 1833 and to what extent those challenges have been mediated. Students could begin to make inferences about the choices available to the Pawnee at this time and place in history.

