
Why Do Some Treaties Fail?

Grades

- 9–12

Subjects

- Geography
- Government and Civics
- History
- Social Studies

Key Message

By the mid-1800s, as the United States grew in power and size, the Pawnee were suffering from disease, warfare, and scarcity of resources. The Pawnee found themselves in an increasingly vulnerable position: they faced incursion onto their lands from whites moving west, and Indian Nations displaced by the United States' removal policy competed with the Pawnee for the same limited resources that the Pawnee needed. The United States at this time had two goals when entering into treaties with the Pawnee Nation: 1) to take its lands, and 2) to assimilate the Pawnee to an "American" way of living. The Pawnee wanted to ensure for their people—as best they could—the security that their cultural and political sovereignty as a nation would remain intact. When Pawnee leaders signed the 1833 and 1857 treaties, they gave up some of their lands in return for protection and services; however, they did not agree to give up their culture, values, and beliefs. The treaties of 1833 and 1857 demonstrate that power imbalances between nations, circumstances and conditions on the ground, and competing worldviews influence the success or failure of international agreements. When one nation does not believe that another nation's culture and governance have any place in society, common resolution cannot be reached. When U.S. officials saw that the Pawnee would not surrender their way of life in exchange for another culture, they intensified their efforts and further relocated the Pawnee Nation, broke legal promises, and turned their backs on their Native allies. Despite this, the Pawnee persevered and managed to maintain important cultural practices. Today the Pawnee Nation acts with political and cultural sovereignty.

Pedagogical Approach

- This online lesson provides teachers and students with some insight into a very difficult and destructive era of Pawnee Nation history. The period was marked by disease, violent conflict, land loss, and the U.S. government's failed but destructive attempts to force the Pawnee to assimilate American culture and the English language. All Native American communities were affected by assimilation policies during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Native histories of assimilation are, like the peoples and cultures themselves, varied and diverse. The assimilation era left a legacy that still impacts Native Peoples today, but the survival of many tribal languages, cultural values, and traditional practices is a testament to the strength and resilience of Native American communities.
- This module utilizes the Inquiry Design Model (IDM), which implements the C3 Inquiry Arc and the C3 Framework Dimension Standards into a student-centered, inquiry-based approach to teaching and learning. Like the IDM, our approach seeks to "honor teachers' knowledge and expertise and avoids over prescription by highlighting key elements, offering pedagogical suggestions, and relying on teacher expertise and experience."¹ Likewise, our module includes an inquiry blueprint that outlines supporting questions, featured sources, and performance tasks necessary for students to construct arguments that pertain to the compelling question. In addition to embodying the C3 Framework and IDM, this module utilizes elements of Understanding by Design (UbD) and Universal Design for Learning (UDL).²

Overarching Standards

Performance tasks in this module revolve around the skills outlined in the Common Core State Standards (CCSS) and the C3 Framework Dimension Standards, which seek to elaborate on the CCSS by diving deeper into skills necessary for college, career, *and civic life*.³ In an effort to provide skills-based assessments and to meet the needs of a diverse body of teachers, we have elected to use these two nationally recognized sets of skills-based standards. The standards we list correlate to measurable, objective-based assessment through formative and summative performance tasks. The content and themes in this module are highly influenced by the National Council for the Social Studies National Curriculum for Social Studies, specifically in the ten themes of social studies and NMAI's own framework for Essential Understandings about American Indians. We also considered other nationally recognized sets of standards, such as the National Geography Standards, the Framework for Twenty-First Century Learning, and the Council for Exceptional Children's Ethical Principals and Professional Practice Standards for Special Educators. While exploring the stages of this inquiry, notice that corresponding Common Core Anchor Standards follow each set of grade-level standards.

1 S. G. Grant, Kathy Swan, and John Lee, *Inquiry-based Practice in Social Studies Education: Understanding the Inquiry Design Model* (New York: Routledge and C3 Teachers, 2017).

2 Grant Wiggins and Jay McTighe, *Understanding by Design* (Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2005; Ron Mace, Center for Universal Design, 1997).

3 John Lee and Kathy Swan, "The C3 Framework and the Common Core State Standards," in "Social Studies For The Next Generation: Purposes, Practices, and implications of the College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards," *NCSS Bulletin 113* (2013): xxii-xxiii; NCSS, "How to Read the C3 Framework," *NCSS Bulletin 113* (2013): 12-13.

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D1.5.9-12. Determine the kinds of sources that will be helpful in answering compelling and supporting questions, taking into consideration multiple points of view represented in the sources, the types of sources available, and the potential uses of the sources.

D4.1.9-12. Construct arguments using precise and knowledgeable claims, with evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging counterclaims and evidentiary weaknesses.

[CCSS: 9-12 Grade Specific Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1: Write [construct] arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST11-12.1: Write [construct] arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

IDM Blueprint

Compelling Question	Why Do Some Treaties Fail?	
Standard	<p>D1.5.9-12. Determining sources from multiple points of view. . . D4.1.9-12. Constructing evidence-based arguments from multiple sources. . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1 and CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST11-12.1 Write [construct] arguments focused on <i>discipline-specific content</i>.</p>	
Staging the Question	Define what a treaty is and consider what forces can shape the outcomes of treaty negotiations between nations.	
Supporting Question One		Supporting Question Two
What happened before, during, and after the 1833 Treaty with the Pawnee?		How did coercion and assimilation lead to the failure of the 1857 Treaty with the Pawnee?
Formative Performance Task		Formative Performance Task
Construct evidence-based claims about why the Treaty of 1833 failed by summarizing the perspectives of the two parties entering into the treaty and synthesizing both the treaty guarantees and concessions each of the two parties agreed to.		Construct claims about why attempts on the part of the U.S. of forced cultural assimilation caused the Treaty of 1857 to fail by providing examples of coercion and assimilation on the part of the U.S. and both summarizing and making inferences about Pawnee actions of resistance.
Featured Sources		Featured Sources
<p>Source Set A: <i>Before the 1833 Treaty</i> Source Set B: <i>The 1833 Treaty</i> Source Set C: <i>After the 1833 Treaty</i></p>		<p>Source Set A: <i>U.S. Coercion and Assimilation</i> Source Set B: <i>Pawnee Actions</i></p>
Summative Performance Task	Argument: Why do some treaties fail? Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay) that addresses the reasons that the U.S. treaties with the Pawnee were set up to fail, using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources, while acknowledging competing views.	
Contemporary Connection	Understand: Members of the Pawnee Nation take pride in their cultural heritage and find ways to celebrate and honor their nation’s rich history.	
	Assess: How the Pawnee Indian Veterans Homecoming Powwow reflects the importance of Pawnee history and culture today.	
Taking Informed Action	Act: <u>NK360° Framework for Taking Informed Action</u>	

Pedagogical Framework

KNOW

In the 1800s the Pawnee and the United States signed two treaties. Hardships drove the Pawnee to the treaty table, and the United States used the vulnerability of the Pawnee as an opportunity to coerce them to assimilate. Although the Pawnee did make concessions in an effort to remain in their homelands with adequate resources and protection, they did not agree to the eradication of their culture.

- **Supporting Question One:** By the 1830s the Pawnee experienced a series of hardships often caused by U.S. policies, which drove the tribe to negotiate treaties with the United States. In the end, the Pawnee did cede some of their lands; however, they did not agree to give up their way of life.
- **Supporting Question Two:** Following the massacre at Willow Creek, the Pawnee continued to experience hardships from the destruction caused by settlers moving westward, conflict with other tribes, and disease. In 1858, in exchange for resources and protection, the Pawnee decided to ask the U.S. for another treaty. The U.S. intended to assimilate the Pawnee to the white American way of life through religion and education. In the end, the U.S. failed to fulfill its treaty promises and did not intervene and mediate the horrific conditions on the Pawnee reservation. With few resources available to them, the Pawnee were removed to Indian Territory in Oklahoma.

UNDERSTAND

Successful compromise occurs when parties come to negotiations in good faith and with the intention to pursue a fair compromise. Conflict often occurs when an imbalance of power results in one group's attempt to eliminate another group's cultural ways. Groups of people go to great lengths to preserve their cultural ways, which is why attempts at forced assimilation are typically unsuccessful.

- **Supporting Question One:** The Pawnee resisted assimilation and made difficult decisions in order to maintain their cultural ways. The U.S. was intent on taking American Indian lands by any means necessary, including tribal removal, coercive treaties, and forced cultural assimilation. There were significant barriers to treaty negotiations, including language barriers and differing cultural values and intentions. In the end the U.S. justified its failure to keep treaty promises by using questionable interpretations of treaty guarantees and conditions.
- **Supporting Question Two:** The U.S. attempted to establish a system of education, rooted in the ideas of white superiority, that was intended to eradicate the Pawnee language, culture, and religion. Despite these efforts of forced cultural assimilation, the Pawnee resisted and took steps to ensure their cultural survival. Desperation often causes groups of people to make concessions they would not normally agree to: with few choices left, the Pawnee agreed to be removed to Indian Territory in Oklahoma.



DO

Why do some treaties fail? Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay) that addresses the reasons that the U.S. treaties with the Pawnee were set up to fail, using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources, while acknowledging competing views.

- **Supporting Question One:** Construct evidence-based claims about why the Treaty of 1833 failed by summarizing the perspectives of the two parties entering into the treaty and synthesizing both the treaty guarantees and concessions each of the two parties agreed to.
- **Supporting Question Two:** Construct claims about why U.S. attempts to force cultural assimilation caused the Treaties of 1833 and 1857 to fail by providing examples of coercion and assimilation on the part of the U.S. and then both summarizing and making inferences about Pawnee actions of resistance.



Suggested Pacing Guides

Traditional Schedule:

Stage	Assessment Materials	Standards
Day 1 Staging the Question Supporting Question 1	<p><u>Resource Annotator Example</u> <i>Teacher Tip: Students can save their annotations as a PDF for the next class or for their summative task.</i></p> <p><u>The 1833 Treaty</u></p>	<p>[C3] D3.3.9-12. Identify evidence . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.9-10.2: Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1.A: Introduce precise claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims . . . organization that establishes clear relationships . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.2: Determine the central ideas . . . primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary . . . relationships among the key details and ideas.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.11-12.1.A: Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), organization that logically sequences the claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.2: Determine central ideas or themes of a text . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics . . .</p>
Day 2 Supporting Question 2	<p><u>Resource Annotator Example</u> <i>Teacher Tip: Students can save their annotations as a PDF for the next class or for their summative task.</i></p> <p><u>The 1857 Treaty</u></p>	<p>[C3]</p> <p>D4.2.9-12. Construct explanations using sound reasoning, . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.9-10.1: Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1: Write [construct] arguments . . . discipline specific content.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.1: Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.11-12.1: Write [construct] arguments . . . disciplinary specific content.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards]</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely to determine . . . text says explicitly . . . make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p>
Day 3 Contemporary Connection Summative Performance Task	<p>Why do some treaties fail? Construct an argument addressing the compelling question.</p>	<p>[C3] D1.5.9-12. Determining sources from multiple points of view. . .</p> <p>D4.1.9-12. Constructing evidence-based arguments from multiple sources. . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics of texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10 & CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.11-12.1 Write [construct] arguments focused on <i>discipline-specific content</i>.</p>
Extension 1-3 Days Taking Informed Action	<p><u>NK360° Framework for Taking Action</u></p>	<p>[C3]</p> <p>D4.7.9-12. Assess options for individual and collective action . . .</p> <p>D4.8.9-12. Apply a range of deliberative and democratic strategies. . . make decisions and take action. . .</p>

Block Schedule:

Stage	Assessment Materials	Anchor Standards
<p>Day 1 Staging the Question</p> <p>Supporting Question 1</p>	<p><u>Resource Annotator Example</u> <i>Teacher Tip: Students can save their annotations as a PDF for the next class or for their summative task.</i></p> <p><u>The 1833 Treaty</u></p>	<p>[C3] D3.3.9-12. Identify evidence . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.9-10.2: Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1.A: Introduce precise claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims . . . organization that establishes clear relationships . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.2: Determine the central ideas . . . primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary . . . relationships among the key details and ideas.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.11-12.1.A: Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), . . . organization that logically sequences the claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.2: Determine central ideas or themes of a text . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics . . .</p>
<p>Day 2 Supporting Question 2</p> <p>Summative Performance Task</p>	<p><u>Resource Annotator Example</u> <i>Teacher Tip: Students can save their annotations as a PDF for the next class or for their summative task.</i></p> <p><u>The 1857 Treaty</u></p>	<p>[C3]</p> <p>D4.2.9-12. Construct explanations using sound reasoning, . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.9-10.1: Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1: Write [construct] arguments . . . discipline specific content.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.1: Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST11-12.1: Write [construct] arguments . . . disciplinary specific content.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards]</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely to determine . . . text says explicitly . . . make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p> <p>[C3] D1.5.9-12. Determining sources from multiple points of view. . .</p> <p>D4.1.9-12. Constructing evidence-based arguments from multiple sources. . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics of texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10 & CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST11-12.1 Write [construct] arguments focused on <i>discipline-specific content</i>.</p>
<p>Extension Contemporary Connection, Taking Informed Action</p>	<p><u>NK360° Framework for Taking Action</u></p>	<p>[C3]</p> <p>D4.7.9-12. Assess options for individual and collective action . . .</p> <p>D4.8.9-12. Apply a range of deliberative and democratic strategies. . . make decisions and take action. . .</p>

Staging the Question Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

Teacher Tip: Before beginning the inquiry, students should have a basic understanding of treaties. Consider playing the **first thirty seconds** of the video [Let's Talk Treaties](#). This video features Native youth explaining in simple and accurate terms key facts that can help students understand the legal meaning of treaties. The entire video runs for a little over two minutes; if you chose to play the full video, there will be some sections that are not specific to the Pawnee Treaties that students will be investigating in this inquiry.

- What is a treaty? You might have students construct a definition for treaties using a mind map. Students can start with their current understandings and then expand on their definition later in the inquiry.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Teacher Tip: The following are suggestions for how you could help students transition from the concept of treaty making in general to establishing context for the 1833 and 1857 Pawnee Treaties. You might choose to introduce the topics of the inquiry in a different way, depending on the needs of your students.

Option A—Discuss: Forces at Work

- Consider leading a brief discussion with students about the pressures that drive nations to the negotiation table and how those factors can influence the outcomes of treaties.

Teacher Tip: In the case of the Pawnee, by the mid-1800s they were suffering from disease, warfare with neighboring tribes, and scarcity of resources. Facing such challenges and knowing that the United States was a growing power, leaders of the Pawnee Nation saw an opportunity to protect their people by engaging in diplomacy with the United States.

Option B—Brainstorm: Forces at Work

- Have students brainstorm—individually, in small groups, or as a class—the many kinds of forces that might be at play for both the Pawnee Nation and the United States at the time of the first treaty featured in this inquiry, the 1833 Treaty. Following the brainstorm, you can direct students to the [opposing viewpoints section](#), featured in the first source set of supporting question one. Students can check their predictions against the facts presented.

Option C—Close Look: Forces at Work

- Preview one force that drove the Pawnee to make a treaty with the United States in 1833: a smallpox epidemic. Show students one of the featured sources in supporting question one, the [smallpox illustration](#). Ask students what they observe and then, what the drawing can tell them about the impact of the epidemic on the ability of the Pawnee to protect their people. You might return to this question at the conclusion of supporting question one to see whether students' responses changed.



Check for Understanding

Teacher TIP: Before moving to supporting question one, consider conducting an informal assessment on the meaning of a treaty. Students should understand that treaties are legal agreements between nations. Article VI of the U.S. Constitution defines treaties between nations as the supreme law of the land, including treaties made between Native Nations and the United States government.

Preview

- Staging the question introduces the compelling question, “Why Do Some Treaties Fail?” In the next section, students will transition to supporting question one: What happened before, during, and after the 1833 Treaty with the Pawnee? You might have students preview the first supporting question by looking at a map of the United States and pointing out where the Pawnee identify their homelands—the central plains, encompassing parts of what is now called Nebraska and Kansas.

Teacher Tip: A map of Pawnee homelands is featured in supporting question two, within the source set The 1833 Treaty.

Supporting Question One: What Happened Before, During, and After the 1833 Treaty with the Pawnee?

Featured Sources

- **Source Set A:** *Before the 1833 Treaty*—Examine the causes that pushed both parties to the treaty table in 1833.
- **Source Set B:** *The 1833 Treaty*—Investigate the language of the 1833 Treaty and consider the concessions each nation made and what they guaranteed to each another.
- **Source Set C:** *After the 1833 Treaty*—Analyze the causes and effects of the failure of the 1833 Treaty.

Student Tasks

- **Resource Annotator Example**—This supporting question includes an interactive resource annotator. Students use the annotator tool to mark up each source and caption. They can use up to five pins for each source to make notes that support the themes of **disadvantages** and **desires**.
- **The 1833 Treaty**



Student Outcomes

KNOW

By the 1830s the Pawnee experienced a series of hardships often caused U.S. by policies, which drove the tribe to negotiate treaties with the United States. In the end, the Pawnee did cede some of their lands; however, they did not agree to give up their way of life.

UNDERSTAND

The Pawnee resisted assimilation and made difficult decisions in order to maintain their cultural ways. The U.S. was intent on taking American Indian lands by any means necessary, including tribal removal, coercive treaties, and forced cultural assimilation. There were significant barriers to treaty negotiations, including language barriers and differing cultural values and intentions. In the end the U.S. justified its failure to keep treaty promises by using questionable interpretations of treaty guarantees and conditions.

DO

Construct evidence-based claims about why the Treaty of 1833 failed by summarizing the perspectives of the two parties entering into the treaty and synthesizing both the treaty guarantees and concessions each of the two parties agreed to.

Standards

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D3.3.9-12. Identify evidence that draws information directly and substantively from multiple sources to detect inconsistencies in evidence in order to revise or strengthen claims.

[CCSS: 9-12 Grade Specific Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.9-10.2: Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary of how key events or ideas develop over the course of the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1.A: Introduce precise claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that establishes clear relationships among the claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.2: Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary that makes clear the relationships among the key details and ideas.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.11-12.1.A: Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences the claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.2: Determine central ideas or themes of a text and analyze their development; summarize the key supporting details and ideas.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

Supporting Question One Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

Part A—Before the Treaty

Teacher TIP: Students can summarize using either paragraph form or bulleted lists.

- Set the stage for students by having them use Part A: Before the Treaty of the ***The 1833 Treaty*** worksheet. Direct students to read the introduction to the source set *Before the Treaty* and analyze both viewpoints. Then ask them to summarize the disadvantages that led the Pawnee to the treaty table and what the United States desired from a treaty with the Pawnee.
- Students can also use the annotator tool to highlight examples of Pawnee disadvantages and U.S. desires shown in the sources by typing explanations that describe why the source shows evidence of either/both themes.

Teacher TIP: Students can print or download and save their annotations as they review each source.

Pawnee Disadvantages	U.S. Desires
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Pawnee faced conflict from rival tribes that were pushed into Pawnee lands. • Smallpox killed about half of the Pawnee people. This made the Pawnee vulnerable to both settlers moving west and rival tribes. • As white settlers arrived and moved west the buffalo population decreased, making it difficult for tribes to sustain themselves. 	<p>The U.S. wanted to take American Indian lands, remove Native Nations to reservations, and assimilate tribes to the white American way of life. As more settlers began to move west, the U.S. wanted to ensure that they had enough land to settle. In order to achieve this, the U.S. pushed rival tribes closer and closer together, often causing tribal conflict. In order to mediate conflict between the Pawnee and rival tribes, the U.S. wanted to acquire a large portion of Pawnee lands to turn into communal hunting areas for all tribes displaced by the federal removal policy. In addition, the U.S. wanted to see if it could assimilate the Pawnee, and then other tribes, by employing strategies of cultural domination. The U.S. attempted to assimilate the Pawnee by employing missionaries for religious conversion and convincing the Pawnee that they would have to become farmers because of elimination of the buffalo by white settlers and sometimes intentional strategies of the U.S. government to deplete buffalo populations.</p>

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Part B—During the Treaty

Teacher TIP: In order to prime students for this task it might be helpful to discuss age-appropriate negotiations or compromises, highlighting that parties involved in negotiations sometimes have to agree to compromises, or to give up certain desires in order to get something else they might need.

- By completing Part A of the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet, students will have some context for understanding the language within the 1833 Treaty. After students examine the sources in the source set [The 1833 Treaty](#), have them separate the information into two categories in Part B of the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet: treaty guarantees and treaty concessions.

	Treaty Guarantees	Treaty Concessions
U.S.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The U.S. gets a tract of land to establish common hunting grounds for displaced tribes. • The U.S. gets to decide how and when to provide funds and guarantees to the Pawnee. • The U.S. is able to educate the Pawnee towards white Western values and ways of life. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The U.S. has to bear the cost of materials and people to educate the Pawnee and teach them how to farm.
Pawnee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Pawnee get \$1,000 per year for ten years for schools and the U.S. will provide teachers. • Each band gets four farmers and each farmer gets \$1,000 worth of oxen and farm animals. • Each band gets one horse mill for grinding corn. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Pawnee cede lands for common hunting grounds. • The Pawnee have to move to a designated area and live there for one year. • The Pawnee will protect the teachers, farmers, and mill. • The Pawnee must allow the U.S. to decide when and how to distribute the guarantees.

Preview

Part B—During the Treaty

- After students complete the exercise in Part B of the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet, ask the class to consider conditions that might push one party to give up more than they would like to. Have the class consider whether both parties came to the treaty table on equal ground. If one party had an advantage over the other, ask students to apply this type of uneven negotiation to their own experiences. This discussion will prepare students to consider how desperation often pushes parties to agree to things they might not generally agree to, such as ceding lands or agreeing to give up certain rights.

Check for Understanding

Part C—Coming to Conclusions

- Go back to the introduction of the source set *The 1833 Treaty* and have students come to a conclusion in Part C of the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet about the most significant barrier to treaty negotiations. The excerpt reads, “One challenge for the Pawnee was the language barrier. No U.S. official spoke the Pawnee language and no Pawnee leader spoke English. Instead, the two parties had to communicate through three different languages: English → French → Pawnee → French → English.”
- Highlight language as the most significant barrier to treaty negotiations. The variety of translations of treaty articles not only disadvantaged the Pawnee during the 1833 Treaty, but also this practice significantly disadvantaged many other tribes during treaty negotiations. Language barriers coupled with different cultural values and negotiation protocols often advantaged the U.S. while disadvantaging Native Nations.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Part D—After the Treaty

- After reviewing all of the sources, have students construct evidence-based claims about why the 1833 Treaty with the Pawnee failed. Students construct two claims and select three pieces of evidence from the source sets to support each claim.

Check for Understanding

- Events result from multiple causes. On the [The 1833 Treaty](#) worksheet students are analyzing the causality of the failure of the 1833 Treaty. As an extension you can have students map causality by dividing the causes into three categories: root causes (those that happen in the beginning), such as differing cultural values or language barriers; causes that build up over time (those that get progressively worse as time goes on), such as the encroachment by white settlers; and final causes (those that happen right before the event), such as the Sioux attack at Willow Creek.

Preview

- Preview the next supporting question by asking students why the Pawnee might choose to once again negotiate a treaty with the United States. Have students consider the forces that pushed the Pawnee to the treaty-making table in 1833 and to what extent those challenges have been mediated. Students could begin to make inferences about the choices available to the Pawnee at this time and place in history.



Supporting Question Two: How Did Coercion and Assimilation Lead to the Failure of the 1857 Treaty with the Pawnee?

Featured Sources

- **Source Set A: *U.S. Coercion and Assimilation***—How did the United States use coercion and assimilation to try to achieve its goals?
- **Source Set B: *Pawnee Actions***—Think about what counts as an action of resistance and see how the Pawnee worked to maintain their culture and sovereignty.

Student Tasks

- ***Resource Annotator Example***—This supporting question includes an interactive resource annotator. Students use the annotator tool to mark up each source and caption. They can use up to five pins for source to make notes about the two themes: **coercion** and **assimilation**.
- ***The 1857 Treaty***



Student Outcomes

KNOW

Following the massacre at Willow Creek, the Pawnee continued to experience hardships caused by the destruction of settlers moving westward, conflict with other tribes, and disease. In 1858, in exchange for resources and protection, the Pawnee decided to ask the U.S. for another treaty. The U.S. intended to assimilate the Pawnee to the white American way of life through religion and education. In the end the U.S. failed to fulfill its treaty promises and did not intervene and mediate the horrific conditions on the Pawnee reservation. With few resources available to them, the Pawnee were removed to Indian Territory in Oklahoma.

UNDERSTAND

The U.S. attempted to establish a system of education, rooted in the ideas of white superiority, that was intended to eradicate the Pawnee language, culture, and religion. Despite these efforts of forced cultural assimilation, the Pawnee resisted and took steps to ensure their cultural survival. Desperation often causes groups of people to make concessions they would not normally agree to: with few choices left, the Pawnee agreed to be removed to Indian Territory in Oklahoma.

DO

Construct claims about why attempts on the part of the U.S. of forced cultural assimilation caused the Treaties of 1833 and 1857 to fail by providing examples of coercion and assimilation on the part of the U.S. and both summarizing and making inferences about Pawnee actions of resistance.

Standards

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D4.2.9-12. Construct explanations using sound reasoning, correct sequence (linear or non-linear), examples, and details with significant and pertinent information and data, while acknowledging the strengths and weaknesses of the explanation given its purpose (e.g., cause and effect, chronological, procedural, technical).

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.9-10.1: Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources, attending to such features as the date and origin of the information.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1: Write [construct] arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.1: Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of primary and secondary sources, connecting insights gained from specific details to an understanding of the text as a whole.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST11-12.1: Write [construct] arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.



Supporting Question Two Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

- Prepare students to look for examples of coercion and assimilation in the source set *Coercion and Assimilation* by reading the definitions aloud in class. Have students define the terms in their own words or provide age-appropriate examples.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Part A—Coercion and Assimilation

- Students analyze the sources in the source set *U.S. Coercion and Assimilation* to find examples that elaborate on the definitions to the left of Part A of *The 1857 Treaty* worksheet. Students can also use the annotator tool to highlight examples of coercion and assimilation shown in the sources by typing explanations that describe why the source shows evidence of **coercion** and/or **assimilation**.

Teacher TIP: Students can use direct quotes as examples or can summarize. You may need to call out for students that language can be used as a tool of coercion. Have students pay close attention to the choice of words that are used in the 1857 Treaty with the Pawnee.

Coercion and Assimilation		
Coercion <i>To persuade by using force or threats.</i>	Example 1	Example 2
	<i>"If any parents keep their child out of school, their family will not receive all of the allowances that the United States has promised to the Pawnee."</i>	
Assimilation <i>A deliberate process, by which the cultures of one group are absorbed into another group. In this case, the U.S. government attempted to force Native Americans to abandon their own cultures and replace them with American culture, values, and the English language.</i>	Example 1	Example 2
	<i>"I would respectfully suggest that there should be for a term of years a uniform and efficient course of instruction pursued with them, in which the males be taught the mechanic arts and agriculture, and the female instructed in household duties."</i>	

Part B—Pawnee Actions

Teacher Tip: Prime students for Part B and the source set *Pawnee Actions* by asking probing questions about why a group of people might not want to give up their culture. Ask students what types of resistance the dominating cultural group might face as they attempt to force another culture to assimilate.

- After examining the sources in the source set *Pawnee Actions*, students summarize three actions taken by the Pawnee to resist forced cultural assimilation. Then they make inferences about why the Pawnee would carry out these actions of resistance.

What Actions Did the Pawnee Take and Why?		
	Summarize Pawnee Actions	Make Inferences about Why
1	Many Pawnee parents refused to send their children to the reservation schools.	Pawnee parents knew that if their children were indoctrinated into Western culture, then the cultural survival of the Pawnee people would be at risk.

Part C—Constructing Claims

Teacher Tip: Prepare students to construct claims by discussing why attempts of forced cultural assimilation might cause treaties to fail. You might elaborate on this discussion by returning to the discussion about how groups of people, when desperate, often make concessions they would not normally agree to.

- In Part C of the *The 1857 Treaty* worksheet students make two claims about why assimilation might cause treaties to fail. They can draw on all the sources provided in both supporting questions one and two in order to construct these claims.

Check for Understanding

- At this point in the inquiry, students should be moving towards the overall understanding that successful compromise occurs when parties come to negotiations in good faith and with the intention to pursue a fair agreement. Conflict often occurs when an imbalance of power results in one group’s attempt to eliminate another group’s cultural ways. Groups of people go to great lengths to preserve their cultures, which is why attempts at forced assimilation are typically unsuccessful.
- Students might have questions about why the Pawnee would agree to be removed to Indian Territory, considering the strong connections they hold to their homelands and cultural ways. Remind students that desperation often causes groups of people to make concessions that would not normally agree to: with few choices left, the Pawnee agreed to be removed to Indian Territory in Oklahoma.

Summative Performance Task

Student Task

- **Summative Performance Task: Evidence Kit**— Build an evidence kit by selecting up to five sources that address the reasons that the U.S. treaties with the Pawnee were set up to fail.

Student Outcomes

KNOW

In the 1800s the Pawnee and the United States signed two treaties. Hardships drove the Pawnee to the treaty table, and the United States used the vulnerability of the Pawnee as an opportunity to coerce them to assimilate. Although the Pawnee did make concessions in an effort to remain in their homelands with adequate resources and protection, they did not agree to the eradication of their culture.

UNDERSTAND

Successful compromise occurs when parties come to negotiations in good faith and with the intention to pursue a fair compromise. Conflict often occurs when an imbalance of power results in one group's attempt to eliminate another group's cultural ways. Groups of people go to great lengths to preserve their cultural ways, which is why attempts at forced assimilation are typically unsuccessful.

DO

Why do some treaties fail? Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay) that addresses the reasons that the U.S. treaties with the Pawnee were set up to fail, using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources, while acknowledging competing views.

Standards

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D1.5.9-12. Determine the kinds of sources that will be helpful in answering compelling and supporting questions, taking into consideration multiple points of view represented in the sources, the types of sources available, and the potential uses of the sources.

D4.1.9-12. Construct arguments using precise and knowledgeable claims, with evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging counterclaims and evidentiary weaknesses.

[CCSS: 9-12 Grade Specific Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.1; 11-12.1: Write [construct] arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

Anticipatory Set

- Return to the compelling question: *Why do some treaties fail?*
- You might briefly revisit the two supporting questions with students to refresh their understanding of key content and concepts.
- Students could reflect on the extent to which their understanding of the compelling question might have changed as they moved through the inquiry.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Summative Assessment

- At this point in the inquiry, students have examined sources that address the reasons that the U.S. treaties with the Pawnee were set up to fail. Students should see that successful compromise occurs when parties come to negotiations in good faith and with the intention to pursue a fair compromise. Conflict often occurs when an imbalance of power results on one group's attempt to eliminate another group's cultural ways. Groups of people go to great lengths to preserve their cultural ways, which is why attempts at forced assimilation are typically unsuccessful. Hardships drove the Pawnee to the treaty table, and the United States used the vulnerability of the Pawnee as an opportunity to coerce them to assimilate. Although the Pawnee did make concessions in an effort to remain in their homelands with adequate resources and protection, they did not agree to the eradication of their culture.
- Students should be expected to demonstrate the breadth of their understandings and their abilities to use evidence from multiple sources to support their claims and refute counterclaims. In this task, students construct an evidence-based argument using multiple sources to answer the compelling question: *Why do some treaties fail?*
- It is important to note that students' arguments could take a variety of forms, including a detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay. Students should construct an argument in one of these forms that addresses the compelling question and acknowledges competing views, using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical sources.
- Students' arguments will vary but could include any of the argument stems presented below. Note that students should support their arguments with specific evidence from the sources they examined in the inquiry and be prepared to acknowledge competing claims or counterarguments.

Argument Stems

Teacher TIP: An argument stem serves as the thesis statement for students' arguments.

- The 1833 and 1857 treaties between the Pawnee and the United States show that some treaties are destined to fail because treaties can be used as tools of coercion. The United States used the treaties to insist that the Pawnee abandon traditions that were critical to their identity, culture, and community. The Pawnee resisted U.S. officials' efforts and took actions to maintain and pass on traditional knowledge systems and practices. However, as the United States grew in power and size and the Pawnee suffered from disease, warfare, and scarcity of resources, the Pawnee became increasingly vulnerable to demands of the United States.



- Some treaties are destined to fail because of the power imbalances between nations. In the case of the United States and the Pawnee Nation, the United States had a critical power advantage and used that position to mandate that the Pawnee give up their culture and ways of life. When Pawnee leaders signed the 1833 and 1857 treaties, they gave up some of their lands in return for protection and services; however, they did not agree to give up their culture, values, and beliefs. The United States used these treaties to create incredibly challenging conditions for the Pawnee to maintain their ways of living.
- By the mid-1800s, the United States had two goals when entering into treaties with the Pawnee: to take lands and to assimilate the Pawnee to an “American” way of living. The treaties of 1833 and 1857 demonstrate that the United States attempted to use treaties as a way to coercively assimilate and relocate the Pawnee Nation. When U.S. officials saw that the Pawnee would not surrender their way of life in exchange for another culture, they intensified their efforts and further relocated the Pawnee Nation, broke legal promises, and turned their backs on their Native allies. Despite this, the Pawnee persevered and managed to maintain important cultural practices.



Contemporary Connections

Featured Sources

- **Case Study:** Pawnee Indian Veterans Homecoming Powwow—Discover one way the Pawnee Nation celebrates its culture and the importance of their history today.

Student Tasks

- **Optional Student Planning Extension:** [*NK360° Framework for Taking Informed Action*](#)

Student Outcomes

KNOW

Native People, communities, organizations, and nations take informed action to mediate social and political issues.

UNDERSTAND

The unique characteristics and challenges of reaffirming tribal culture and how the Pawnee Nation celebrates its culture by organizing events such as the Indian Veterans Homecoming Powwow.

DO

Identify, describe, and infer the characteristics of community organizing and how Native Nations organize to celebrate and sustain native cultures.



Standards

Contemporary Connection

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D4.7.9-12. Assess options for individual and collective action to address local, regional, and global problems by engaging in self-reflection, strategy identification, and complex causal reasoning.

D4.6.9-12. Use disciplinary and interdisciplinary lenses to understand the characteristics and causes of local, regional, and global problems; instances of such problems in multiple contexts; and challenges and opportunities faced by those trying to address these problems over time and place.

Part D—Extension Expository Essay

[CCSS: 9-12 Grade Specific Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.9-10.2: Write informative/explanatory texts, including the narration of historical events, scientific procedures/ experiments, or technical processes.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.11-12.2: Write informative/explanatory texts, including the narration of historical events, scientific procedures/experiments, or technical processes.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.2: Write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content.

Extension Taking Informed Action

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D4.7.9-12. Assess options for individual and collective action to address local, regional, and global problems by engaging in self-reflection, strategy identification, and complex causal reasoning.

D4.8.9-12. Apply a range of deliberative and democratic strategies and procedures to make decisions and take action in their classrooms, schools, and out-of-school civic contexts.

Contemporary Connections Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

- Ask students what the word *agency* means (*agency* means the ability to act or use power).
- As needed, help students define the word in their own terms. Students might brainstorm examples of agency in their own lives.
- Transition to the concept of agency as it relates to this inquiry: although the Pawnee did make concessions in an effort to remain in their homelands with adequate resources and protection, they did not agree to the eradication of their culture.
- Today, the Pawnee Nation of Oklahoma includes tribally enrolled members that live on the Pawnee reservation in Oklahoma as well as across all areas of the United States. Members of the Pawnee Nation take pride in their cultural heritage and find ways to celebrate and honor their nation's rich history.

Guided Practice and Optional Expository Writing

- Explain to students that one way in which we can see how the Pawnee celebrate their culture and reflect on the importance of their history is through the Pawnee Indian Veterans Homecoming Powwow.
- Direct students to the contemporary-connections case study, [**Pawnee Indian Veterans Homecoming Powwow.**](#)
- After examining the images, reading the supporting text, and considering the discussion questions, students might complete an expository-writing sample about the significance of the Pawnee Indian Veterans Homecoming Powwow to maintaining cultural ways.