Staging the Question Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

Teacher Tip: Before beginning the inquiry, students should have a basic understanding of treaties. Consider playing the first thirty seconds of the video Let’s Talk Treaties. This video features Native youth explaining in simple and accurate terms key facts that can help students understand the legal meaning of treaties. The entire video runs for a little over two minutes; if you chose to play the full video, there will be some sections that are not specific to the Navajo Treaty that students will investigate in this inquiry.

- What is a treaty? You might have students construct a definition for treaties and then expand on their definition later in the inquiry.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Teacher Tip: Resistance is a big idea in this inquiry. The following are suggestions for how you could help students transition from the concept of treaty making in general to establishing a context for the Navajo Treaty of 1868 and the theme of resistance. Below are four ideas for how students could brainstorm reasons why people, communities, and nations make sacrifices, plan resistance, and organize against oppression.

Option A—Mind Mapping

- You might have students brainstorm using a mind map. Students could use the word resistance as the central idea and then think of sub ideas that are associated with the big idea of resistance. Students might return to their mind map at the conclusion of the inquiry to see how their initial ideas about resistance may have changed.

Option B—Word Storming

- Consider helping students create a word storm about the big idea of resistance. Students first write down any word that comes to mind that is associated with the term resistance. Students could return to their word storms as they move through the inquiry in order to reflect on patterns or relationships they observe that are specific to the Navajo’s (Diné’s) journey home.

Option C—Visual Association

- One way students can brainstorm ideas about the theme of resistance is through a visual association. Students could preview an image that they will encounter in the inquiry that demonstrates an element of Navajo (Diné) resistance to actions by the United States.
- Direct students to the source set Bosque Redondo. You might project the image “Blanket Weaver” and read the source’s caption. Ask students to write down or share reasons why this image relates to the big idea of resistance. Alternatively, you could show students the image and the quote “Navajo (Diné) Leaders, Chief Barboncito’s
Response to General Sherman* and ask how this source is an example of resistance against oppression.

Option D—Ask Questions
- Finally, you could have students raise questions they have about the big idea of resistance. Students might write their questions down, share with a peer, or discuss as a class. Patterns may emerge about what students associate with the idea of resistance and any questions they might need to address before beginning the inquiry.

Teacher TIP: Depending on your students’ needs and their familiarity with American Indian history and United States history, you might consider giving some context about the particular time and place this inquiry examines. This inquiry begins as the Navajo (Diné) Nation is waging an armed resistance against further incursion by white settlers and other tribes onto Navajo (Diné) homelands. Following the Mexican-American War and the signing of the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo in 1848, the United States was poised to take more lands and increase settlement in the Southwest. The Navajo (Diné), along with many other Native Nations, tenaciously defended their homelands, sovereignty, and culture. Students should keep in mind that this inquiry will offer Native perspectives about a troubling and painful chapter in United States history that created suffering, loss, and hardship. Yet, during an era in which so many Native Nations were forcibly removed from their homelands and were not able to return to the places to which they belonged, the Navajo (Diné) somehow found a way to go home.

Check for Understanding
Teacher TIP: Before moving to supporting question one, consider conducting an informal assessment on the meaning of a treaty. Students should understand that treaties are legal agreements between nations. Article VI of the U.S. Constitution defines treaties between nations as the supreme law of the land, including treaties made between Native Nations and the United States government.

Preview
- Stage the question by introducing the compelling question, Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? In the next section, students will transition to supporting question one: Why was it critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home? You might have students preview the first supporting question by looking at a map of the United States and pointing out where the Navajo identify their homelands—in the area today known as the states of Colorado, New Mexico, and Arizona.

Teacher Tip: A map of Navajo (Diné) homelands is featured in supporting question one as an introduction in Source Set A: The Long Walk.
Supporting Question One: Why Was It Critical for the Navajo to Return Home?

Featured Sources

- **Source Set A: The Long Walk**—Assess the actions of the United States against the Navajo (Diné) before, during, and after the Long Walk to the Bosque Redondo Reservation.
- **Source Set B: Bosque Redondo**—Examine the ways in which the Navajo (Diné) exercised resistance, persistence, resilience, and negotiation in order to return home.

Student Tasks

- **Resolve**

Student Outcomes

**KNOW:**

During an era when many Native Nations found themselves forcibly removed from their homelands, the Navajo (Diné) also faced increasing pressure to leave their ancestral home. In the mid-1800s, the United States emerged as a nation driven to expand its territory west of the Mississippi. After many invasions by Spain, Mexico, and eventually the United States, the Navajo (Diné) mounted campaigns of resistance in order to remain in their ancestral homelands. With few choices, thousands of Navajo (Diné) were forced to march between 250 and 450 miles to the Bosque Redondo Reservation. They suffered enormous loss and horrific conditions during the Long Walk and while interned by the United States government. Despite enormous suffering and loss, Navajo (Diné) leaders successfully used the treaty-making process to return to their homelands.

**UNDERSTAND:**

Navajo (Diné) homelands hold enormous spiritual and cultural power. These homelands—the Dinétah—are the foundation of generations of knowledge, practices, and teachings. When the Navajo (Diné) were uprooted from their homelands and forcibly marched to the internment camp Bosque Redondo, they suffered enormous loss and experienced horrific conditions at the hands of the United States government. U.S. officials tried to persuade the Navajo (Diné) to relocate to Indian Territory as an alternative to living at Bosque Redondo, but leaders of the Navajo (Diné) Nation refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured a return to their homelands.

**DO:**

Craft a claim about why it was critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home. First assess the actions of the United States against the Navajo (Diné) and then cite evidence about different ways the Navajo (Diné) demonstrated resolve to return home.
Standards
[C3 Dimension Standards]
D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics of places and regions are connected to human identities and cultures.
D2.His.13.6-8. Evaluate the relevancy and utility of a historical source based on information such as maker, date, place of origin, intended audience, and purpose.

[CCSS: 6-8 Grade Specific Standards]
CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.
CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.
CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports an analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.
CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]
CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.
CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.
Supporting Question One Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set
- As a class, have students closely examine the introduction section of Source Set A: The Long Walk.
- Lead a discussion with students in which they cite the locations of the traditional Navajo (Diné) homelands and assess why these homelands are important to the Navajo (Diné).

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Part A—The Long Walk: Assess and Apply

Teacher TIP: The sources contained in the two source sets, The Long Walk and Bosque Redondo, reflect the harsh and often inhumane treatment the Navajo (Diné) received at the hands of the United States government. Prior to beginning these source sets with your students, you might discuss the sensitivity of this topic and its significance to developing a more complete understanding of United States history.

- Students can work individually, with partners, or in groups to analyze the source set. First, students review the sources, captions, and discussion questions in Source Set A. Next, in the column "U.S. Actions," they assess how the U.S. violated Navajo (Diné) human rights and provide evidence from the source set about U.S. actions. Then, students apply how that action would be a violation of human rights.
- Discuss with students the consequences of violating human rights. Consider asking whether the United States government faced accountability for its actions.

Part B—Navajo (Diné) Resolve: Cite Evidence

Working as a class, with partners, or in groups, students cite evidence from Source Set B: Bosque Redondo that demonstrates how the Navajo (Diné) exercised resolve by using resistance, persistence, resilience, and negotiation.

Teacher TIP: If your students are unfamiliar with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, you may need to allocate time to preview this content. You can also opt to speak more generally about the concept of human rights and ask students to consider what rights all people should have because they are part of the human community.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How Did They Do It?</th>
<th>Evidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resistance</td>
<td>Navajo leaders resisted U.S. efforts to remove their people to a reservation in Indian Territory.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persistence</td>
<td>Chief Mangascolori continued to stand up to the U.S. and fight against the terrible conditions at Bosque Redondo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resilience</td>
<td>Navajo women used their knowledge of weaving to continue parts of their culture even while they were interned at Bosque Redondo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negotiation</td>
<td>Navajo women persisted with U.S. negotiators and agreed to negotiate a treaty between the U.S. and the Navajo Nation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Teacher TIP: This graphic organizer represents evidence that students might use to explain how the Navajo exercised different forms of resolve while interned at Bosque Redondo.
Check for Understanding
Part C—Coming to Conclusions

- Now that students have reviewed both source sets, they are ready to come to some conclusions about why it was critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home. In Part C—Coming to Conclusions, students craft a claim and use evidence about why the Navajo (Diné) maintained the resolve to return home.

- Check for understanding about why it was critical that the Navajo (Diné) return home: Navajo (Diné) homelands hold enormous spiritual and cultural power. These homelands—the Dinétah—are the foundation of generations of knowledge, practices, and teachings. When the Navajo (Diné) were uprooted from their homelands and forcibly marched to the internment camp Bosque Redondo, they suffered enormous loss and experienced horrific conditions at the hands of the United States government. U.S. officials tried to persuade the Navajo (Diné) to relocate to Indian Territory as an alternative to living at Bosque Redondo, but leaders of the Navajo (Diné) Nation refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured a return to their homelands.

- In supporting question two, students will consider how agency on the part of Navajo (Diné) leaders and citizens—demonstrated through negotiation of challenging compromises and incredible persistence—allowed them to sustain their culture across generations.