

Teacher Materials Lesson at a Glance

Why Was the Navajo Journey Home So Remarkable?

Grades

- 6-8

Subjects

- Geography
- Government and Civics
- History
- Social Studies

Key Message

During an era when many Native Nations found themselves forcibly removed from their homelands, the Navajo (Diné) also faced increasing pressure to leave their ancestral home. In the mid-1800s, the United States emerged as a nation driven to expand its territory west of the Mississippi. Like many Native Nations, the Navajo (Diné) signed treaties as well as fought against American efforts to create pathways from the East to California. Despite all their efforts, the Navajo (Diné) people were removed from their homelands by the United States government in the 1860s—yet they maintained an unflinching resolve to return home. The Navajo's (Diné's) remarkable journey home provides an angle to consider the importance of the Navajo Treaty of 1868. By signing the 1868 Treaty, the Navajo (Diné) Nation made cultural and political cessions to the United States; however, the Treaty also reserved the right for citizens of the Navajo (Diné) Nation to return to their sacred homelands. The Navajo Treaty of 1868 and the nation's journey home show how leaders and members of the Navajo (Diné) Nation exercised agency and enormous strength to reaffirm and rebuild Navajo (Diné) nationhood, culture, and sovereignty.

Pedagogical Approach

This inquiry offers Native perspectives about a troubling and painful chapter in United States history that created suffering, loss, and hardship. Yet, during an era in which so many Native Nations were forcibly removed from their homelands and were not able to return to the places to which they belonged, the Navajo (Diné) somehow found a way to go home. The Navajo Treaty of 1868, despite its assimilation-heavy language, continues to serve as an important symbol of Navajo (Diné) sovereignty today. The implicit tension entrenched in the Treaty of 1868 speaks to the difficult choices that leaders of nations often face. Power imbalances and desperation often causes groups of people to make concessions they would not normally agree to. In 1868 the Navajo (Diné), in a desperate move to return to their native homelands and escape the harsh conditions at Bosque Redondo, agreed to relinquish some of their sovereignty. In this inquiry students will grapple with the idea of difficult compromise as one way in which nations can strategize to achieve success in the long term, even if it requires sacrifice in the short term.

This module utilizes the Inquiry Design Model (IDM), which implements the C3 Inquiry Arc and the C3 Framework Dimension Standards in a student-centered, inquiry-based approach to teaching and learning. Like the IDM, our approach seeks to “honor teachers’ knowledge and expertise and avoids over prescription by highlighting key elements, offering pedagogical suggestions, and relying on teacher expertise and experience.”¹ Likewise, our module includes an inquiry blueprint that outlines supporting questions, featured sources, and performance tasks necessary for students to construct arguments that pertain to the compelling question. In addition to embodying the C3 Framework and IDM, this module utilizes elements of Understanding by Design (UbD) and Universal Design for Learning (UDL).²

Overarching Standards

Performance tasks in this module revolve around the skills outlined in the Common Core State Standards (CCSS) and the C3 Framework Dimension Standards, which seek to elaborate on the CCSS by diving deeper into skills necessary for college, career, *and civic life*.³ In an effort to provide skills-based assessments and to meet the needs of a diverse body of teachers, we have elected to use these two nationally recognized sets of skills-based standards. The standards we list correlate to measurable objective-based assessment through formative and summative performance tasks. The content and themes in this module are highly influenced by the National Council for the Social Studies National Curriculum for Social Studies, specifically in the ten themes of social studies and NMAI’s own framework for Essential Understandings about American Indians.

1 S. G. Grant, Kathy Swan, and John Lee, *Inquiry-based Practice in Social Studies Education: Understanding the Inquiry Design Model* (New York: Routledge and C3 Teachers, 2017).

2 Grant Wiggins and Jay McTighe, *Understanding by Design* (Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2005); Ron Mace, Center for Universal Design (1997).

3 John Lee and Kathy Swan, “The C3 Framework and the Common Core State Standards,” in *Social Studies for the Next Generation: Purposes, Practices, and Implications of the College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards*, *NCSS Bulletin* 113 (2013): xxii-xxiii; NCSS, “How to Read the C3 Framework,” *NCSS Bulletin* 113 (2013): 12-13.

We also considered other nationally recognized sets of standards, such as the National Geography Standards, the Framework for Twenty-First Century Learning, and the Council for Exceptional Children's Ethical Principles and Professional Practice Standards for Special Educators. While exploring the stages of this inquiry, notice that corresponding Common Core Anchor Standards follow each set of grade-level standards.

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D1.5.6-8. Determine the kinds of sources that will be helpful in answering compelling and supporting questions, taking into consideration multiple points of views represented in the sources.

D4.1.6-8. Construct arguments using claims and evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging the strengths and limitations of the arguments.

[CCSS: 6-8 Grade Specific Standard]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1 Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

[CCSS Anchor Standard]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

IDM Blueprint

Compelling Question	Why Was the Navajo Journey Home So Remarkable?	
Standard	<p>D1.5.6-8. Determining sources from multiple points of view . . .</p> <p>D4.1.6-8. Constructing evidence-based arguments from multiple sources . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1 Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</p>	
Staging the Question	Brainstorm reasons why people, communities, and nations make sacrifices, plan resistance, and organize against oppression.	
Supporting Question One		Supporting Question Two
Why was it critical for the Navajo to return home?		How did the Navajo’s return home sustain their culture for generations to come?
Formative Performance Task		Formative Performance Task
Craft a claim about why it was critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home: first assess the actions of the United States against the Navajo (Diné), and then cite evidence about different ways the Navajo (Diné) demonstrated resolve to return home.		Craft an evidence-based claim about how the Navajo’s (Diné’s) return home sustains Navajo (Diné) culture for generations to come: first interpret treaty language and then make inferences about how the compromises the Navajo (Diné) were willing to make in order to return home show agency.
Featured Sources		Featured Sources
<p>Source Set A: <i>The Long Walk</i></p> <p>Source Set B: <i>Bosque Redondo</i></p>		<p>Source Set A: <i>The Navajo Treaty of 1868</i></p> <p>Source Set B: <i>The Return Home</i></p>
Summative Performance Task	<p>Argument: Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay) that addresses why the Navajo (Diné) experience that led up to the 1868 Treaty and subsequent return to their homelands was so remarkable. Use specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources, while acknowledging competing views.</p>	
Contemporary Connection	<p>Understand: Since the 1868 Navajo Treaty, the Navajo (Diné) have always desired to gain back more of their ancestral homelands.</p>	
	<p>Assess: How does the Navajo (Diné) Nation continue to find ways to secure and sustain its homelands for future generations?</p>	
Taking Informed Action	<p>Act: <u>NK360° Framework for Taking Informed Action</u></p>	

Pedagogical Framework

KNOW

The Navajo's (Diné's) ancestral homelands, the Diné'tah, are the foundation of generations of knowledge about the land and cultural practices. In 1863 the United States government forcibly removed the Navajo (Diné) from their homelands and interned them at the Bosque Redondo Reservation. During their internment, the Navajo (Diné) endured miserable conditions, which led to enormous suffering and death. As U.S. officials began to realize that they could not sustain the reservation, they tried to persuade Navajo (Diné) leaders to relocate to Indian Territory. However, Navajo (Diné) leaders and community members refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured their return to a portion of their homelands and resources to help them rebuild. The 1868 Treaty, however, required difficult compromises from Navajo (Diné) Peoples. Upon returning to their homelands, the Navajo (Diné) faced an enormous challenge to renew and rebuild their lands. Today, the Navajo (Diné) Nation continues to find ways to secure and sustain the abundance of lands and reaffirm their culture.

- **Supporting Question One:** During an era when many Native Nations found themselves forcibly removed from their homelands, the Navajo (Diné) also faced increasing pressure to leave their ancestral home. In the mid-1800s, the United States emerged as a nation driven to expand its territory west of the Mississippi. After many invasions by Spain, Mexico, and eventually the United States, the Navajo (Diné) mounted campaigns of resistance in order to remain in their ancestral homelands. With few choices, thousands of Navajo (Diné) were forced to march between 250 and 450 miles to the Bosque Redondo Reservation. They suffered enormous loss and horrific conditions during the Long Walk and while interned by the United States government. Despite enormous suffering and loss, Navajo (Diné) leaders successfully used the treaty-making process to return to their homelands.
- **Supporting Question Two:** For the Navajo (Diné) the 1868 Treaty allowed a return to their ancestral homelands (Diné'tah) and is important to Navajo (Diné) sovereignty. However, the Treaty also required Navajo (Diné) leaders to make difficult compromises. The Treaty stipulated compulsory schooling for Navajo (Diné) children, allowance of railroads to pass through Navajo (Diné) lands, and an assurance from the Navajo (Diné) that they would not harm wagon trains or cattle crossing their lands. The Navajo's (Diné's) return home was not without challenge or sacrifice. Not only did they have to rebuild their homelands from the scorched-earth campaigns waged by the United States, but they also faced the challenge of sustaining their culture for future generations.

UNDERSTAND

The Navajo's (Diné's) journey home demonstrated incredible leadership and agency on the part of the Navajo (Diné) Nation. From fighting against incursions on their homelands by white settlers, to demonstrating strength during the Long Walk and while interned at Bosque Redondo, community members maintained an unflinching resolve to return home. With persistence, determination, and negotiation, Navajo (Diné) leaders successfully negotiated with U.S. officials and secured the rights to return to their ancestral homelands.

- **Supporting Question One:** The Navajo's (Diné's) homelands hold enormous spiritual and cultural power. Their homelands—the Dinétah—are the foundation of generations of knowledge, practices, and teachings. When the Navajo (Diné) were uprooted from their homelands and forcibly marched to the internment camp Bosque Redondo, they suffered enormous loss and experienced horrific conditions at the hands of the United States government. U.S. officials tried to persuade the Navajo (Diné) to relocate to Indian Territory as an alternative to living at Bosque Redondo, but leaders of the Navajo (Diné) Nation refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured a return to their homelands.
- **Supporting Question Two:** The Navajo (Diné) faced incredible difficulty both in convincing the United States to allow them to reclaim their homelands and in the conditions they found there upon their return. The disparate power relations between the United States and the Navajo (Diné) make their journey home and subsequent renewal remarkable. While the 3.5-million-acre reservation recognized under the Treaty was a fraction of the Navajo's (Diné's) traditional tribal homelands, it set the stage for future actions by the Navajo (Diné) to resist and persist and gain back more of their lands in the nineteenth, twentieth and twenty-first centuries.

DO

Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay) that addresses why the Navajo (Diné) experience that led up to the 1868 Treaty and subsequent return to their homelands was so remarkable. Use specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources, while acknowledging competing views.

- **Supporting Question One:** Craft a claim about why it was critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home. First assess the actions of the United States against the Navajo (Diné) and then cite evidence about different ways the Navajo (Diné) demonstrated resolve to return home.
- **Supporting Question Two:** Craft an evidence-based claim about how the Navajo's (Diné's) return home sustains Navajo (Diné) culture for generations to come. First interpret the Treaty language and then make inferences about how the compromises the Navajo (Diné) were willing to make in order to return home shows agency.



Suggested Pacing Guide

Traditional Schedule:

Stage	Assessment Materials	Standards
Day 1 Staging the Question Supporting Question One	<u>Resolve</u>	<p>[C3] D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics . . . connected to human identities and cultures. D2.His.13.6-8. Evaluate the relevancy and utility of a historical source based on information . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p>
Day 2 Supporting Question Two	<p><u>Resource Annotator Example</u> <i>Teacher Tip: Students can save their annotations as a PDF for their summative task.</i></p> <p><u>Agency</u></p>	<p>[C3] D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics . . . connected to human identities and cultures. D2.Civ.3.6-8. Examine the origins, purposes, and impact of . . . treaties . . . D4.1.6-8. Construct arguments using claims and evidence . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p>
Day 3 Contemporary Connection Summative Performance Task	<p>Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? Construct an argument addressing the compelling question.</p>	<p>[C3] D1.5.6-8. Determining sources from multiple points of view . . . D4.1.6-8. Constructing evidence-based arguments from multiple sources . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1 Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1 Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</p>
Extension 1-3 Days Taking Informed Action	<u>NK360° Framework for Taking Action</u>	<p>[C3] D4.7.6-8. Assess options for individual and collective action . . . D4.6.6-8. Draw on multiple disciplinary lenses. . .</p>

Block Schedule:

Stage	Assessment Materials	Standards
<p>Day 1 Staging the Question Supporting Question One</p>	<p><u>Resolve</u></p>	<p>[C3] D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics . . . connected to human identities and cultures. D2.His.13.6-8. Evaluate the relevancy and utility of a historical source based on information . . . [CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources. [CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p>
<p>Day 2 Supporting Question Two Summative Performance Task</p>	<p><u>Resource Annotator Example</u> <i>Teacher Tip: Students can save their annotations as a PDF for their summative task.</i> <u>Agency</u> Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? Construct an argument addressing the compelling question.</p>	<p>[C3] D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics . . . connected to human identities and cultures. D2.Civ.3.6-8. Examine the origins, purposes, and impact of . . . treaties . . . D4.1.6-8. Construct arguments using claims and evidence . . . [CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources. [CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p> <p>[C3] D1.5.6-8. Determining sources from multiple points of view . . . D4.1.6-8. Constructing evidence-based arguments from multiple sources . . . [CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1 Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content. [CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1 Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</p>
<p>Extension Contemporary Connection, Taking Informed Action</p>	<p><u>NK360° Framework for Taking Action</u></p>	<p>[C3] D4.7.6-8. Assess options for individual and collective action . . . D4.6.6-8. Draw on multiple disciplinary lenses. . .</p>