

Teacher Materials
Full LessonWhy Was the Navajo Journey Home So
Remarkable?**Grades**

- 6-8

Subjects

- Geography
- Government and Civics
- History
- Social Studies

Key Message

During an era when many Native Nations found themselves forcibly removed from their homelands, the Navajo (Diné) also faced increasing pressure to leave their ancestral home. In the mid-1800s, the United States emerged as a nation driven to expand its territory west of the Mississippi. Like many Native Nations, the Navajo (Diné) signed treaties as well as fought against American efforts to create pathways from the East to California. Despite all their efforts, the Navajo (Diné) people were removed from their homelands by the United States government in the 1860s—yet they maintained an unflinching resolve to return home. The Navajo's (Diné's) remarkable journey home provides an angle to consider the importance of the Navajo Treaty of 1868. By signing the 1868 Treaty, the Navajo (Diné) Nation made cultural and political cessions to the United States; however, the Treaty also reserved the right for citizens of the Navajo (Diné) Nation to return to their sacred homelands. The Navajo Treaty of 1868 and the nation's journey home show how leaders and members of the Navajo (Diné) Nation exercised agency and enormous strength to reaffirm and rebuild Navajo (Diné) nationhood, culture, and sovereignty.

Pedagogical Approach

This inquiry offers Native perspectives about a troubling and painful chapter in United States history that created suffering, loss, and hardship. Yet, during an era in which so many Native Nations were forcibly removed from their homelands and were not able to return to the places to which they belonged, the Navajo (Diné) somehow found a way to go home. The Navajo Treaty of 1868, despite its assimilation-heavy language, continues to serve as an important symbol of Navajo (Diné) sovereignty today. The implicit tension entrenched in the Treaty of 1868 speaks to the difficult choices that leaders of nations often face. Power imbalances and desperation often causes groups of people to make concessions they would not normally agree to. In 1868 the Navajo (Diné), in a desperate move to return to their native homelands and escape the harsh conditions at Bosque Redondo, agreed to relinquish some of their sovereignty. In this inquiry students will grapple with the idea of difficult compromise as one way in which nations can strategize to achieve success in the long term, even if it requires sacrifice in the short term.

This module utilizes the Inquiry Design Model (IDM), which implements the C3 Inquiry Arc and the C3 Framework Dimension Standards in a student-centered, inquiry-based approach to teaching and learning. Like the IDM, our approach seeks to “honor teachers’ knowledge and expertise and avoids over prescription by highlighting key elements, offering pedagogical suggestions, and relying on teacher expertise and experience.”¹ Likewise, our module includes an inquiry blueprint that outlines supporting questions, featured sources, and performance tasks necessary for students to construct arguments that pertain to the compelling question. In addition to embodying the C3 Framework and IDM, this module utilizes elements of Understanding by Design (UbD) and Universal Design for Learning (UDL).²

Overarching Standards

Performance tasks in this module revolve around the skills outlined in the Common Core State Standards (CCSS) and the C3 Framework Dimension Standards, which seek to elaborate on the CCSS by diving deeper into skills necessary for college, career, *and civic life*.³ In an effort to provide skills-based assessments and to meet the needs of a diverse body of teachers, we have elected to use these two nationally recognized sets of skills-based standards. The standards we list correlate to measurable objective-based assessment through formative and summative performance tasks. The content and themes in this module are highly influenced by the National Council for the Social Studies National Curriculum for Social Studies, specifically in the ten themes of social studies and NMAI’s own framework for Essential Understandings about American Indians.

1 S. G. Grant, Kathy Swan, and John Lee, *Inquiry-based Practice in Social Studies Education: Understanding the Inquiry Design Model* (New York: Routledge and C3 Teachers, 2017).

2 Grant Wiggins and Jay McTighe, *Understanding by Design* (Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2005); Ron Mace, Center for Universal Design (1997).

3 John Lee and Kathy Swan, “The C3 Framework and the Common Core State Standards,” in *Social Studies for the Next Generation: Purposes, Practices, and Implications of the College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards*, *NCSS Bulletin* 113 (2013): xxii-xxiii; NCSS, “How to Read the C3 Framework,” *NCSS Bulletin* 113 (2013): 12-13.

We also considered other nationally recognized sets of standards, such as the National Geography Standards, the Framework for Twenty-First Century Learning, and the Council for Exceptional Children's Ethical Principles and Professional Practice Standards for Special Educators. While exploring the stages of this inquiry, notice that corresponding Common Core Anchor Standards follow each set of grade-level standards.

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D1.5.6-8. Determine the kinds of sources that will be helpful in answering compelling and supporting questions, taking into consideration multiple points of views represented in the sources.

D4.1.6-8. Construct arguments using claims and evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging the strengths and limitations of the arguments.

[CCSS: 6-8 Grade Specific Standard]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1 Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

[CCSS Anchor Standard]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

IDM Blueprint

Compelling Question	Why Was the Navajo Journey Home So Remarkable?	
Standard	<p>D1.5.6-8. Determining sources from multiple points of view . . .</p> <p>D4.1.6-8. Constructing evidence-based arguments from multiple sources . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1 Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</p>	
Staging the Question	Brainstorm reasons why people, communities, and nations make sacrifices, plan resistance, and organize against oppression.	
Supporting Question One		Supporting Question Two
Why was it critical for the Navajo to return home?		How did the Navajo’s return home sustain their culture for generations to come?
Formative Performance Task		Formative Performance Task
Craft a claim about why it was critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home: first assess the actions of the United States against the Navajo (Diné), and then cite evidence about different ways the Navajo (Diné) demonstrated resolve to return home.		Craft an evidence-based claim about how the Navajo’s (Diné’s) return home sustains Navajo (Diné) culture for generations to come: first interpret treaty language and then make inferences about how the compromises the Navajo (Diné) were willing to make in order to return home show agency.
Featured Sources		Featured Sources
<p>Source Set A: <i>The Long Walk</i></p> <p>Source Set B: <i>Bosque Redondo</i></p>		<p>Source Set A: <i>The Navajo Treaty of 1868</i></p> <p>Source Set B: <i>The Return Home</i></p>
Summative Performance Task	<p>Argument: Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay) that addresses why the Navajo (Diné) experience that led up to the 1868 Treaty and subsequent return to their homelands was so remarkable. Use specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources, while acknowledging competing views.</p>	
Contemporary Connection	<p>Understand: Since the 1868 Navajo Treaty, the Navajo (Diné) have always desired to gain back more of their ancestral homelands.</p>	
	<p>Assess: How does the Navajo (Diné) Nation continue to find ways to secure and sustain its homelands for future generations?</p>	
Taking Informed Action	<p>Act: <u>NK360° Framework for Taking Informed Action</u></p>	

Pedagogical Framework

KNOW

The Navajo's (Diné's) ancestral homelands, the Dinétah, are the foundation of generations of knowledge about the land and cultural practices. In 1863 the United States government forcibly removed the Navajo (Diné) from their homelands and interned them at the Bosque Redondo Reservation. During their internment, the Navajo (Diné) endured miserable conditions, which led to enormous suffering and death. As U.S. officials began to realize that they could not sustain the reservation, they tried to persuade Navajo (Diné) leaders to relocate to Indian Territory. However, Navajo (Diné) leaders and community members refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured their return to a portion of their homelands and resources to help them rebuild. The 1868 Treaty, however, required difficult compromises from Navajo (Diné) Peoples. Upon returning to their homelands, the Navajo (Diné) faced an enormous challenge to renew and rebuild their lands. Today, the Navajo (Diné) Nation continues to find ways to secure and sustain the abundance of lands and reaffirm their culture.

- **Supporting Question One:** During an era when many Native Nations found themselves forcibly removed from their homelands, the Navajo (Diné) also faced increasing pressure to leave their ancestral home. In the mid-1800s, the United States emerged as a nation driven to expand its territory west of the Mississippi. After many invasions by Spain, Mexico, and eventually the United States, the Navajo (Diné) mounted campaigns of resistance in order to remain in their ancestral homelands. With few choices, thousands of Navajo (Diné) were forced to march between 250 and 450 miles to the Bosque Redondo Reservation. They suffered enormous loss and horrific conditions during the Long Walk and while interned by the United States government. Despite enormous suffering and loss, Navajo (Diné) leaders successfully used the treaty-making process to return to their homelands.
- **Supporting Question Two:** For the Navajo (Diné) the 1868 Treaty allowed a return to their ancestral homelands (Dinétah) and is important to Navajo (Diné) sovereignty. However, the Treaty also required Navajo (Diné) leaders to make difficult compromises. The Treaty stipulated compulsory schooling for Navajo (Diné) children, allowance of railroads to pass through Navajo (Diné) lands, and an assurance from the Navajo (Diné) that they would not harm wagon trains or cattle crossing their lands. The Navajo's (Diné's) return home was not without challenge or sacrifice. Not only did they have to rebuild their homelands from the scorched-earth campaigns waged by the United States, but they also faced the challenge of sustaining their culture for future generations.

UNDERSTAND

The Navajo's (Diné's) journey home demonstrated incredible leadership and agency on the part of the Navajo (Diné) Nation. From fighting against incursions on their homelands by white settlers, to demonstrating strength during the Long Walk and while interned at Bosque Redondo, community members maintained an unflinching resolve to return home. With persistence, determination, and negotiation, Navajo (Diné) leaders successfully negotiated with U.S. officials and secured the rights to return to their ancestral homelands.



- **Supporting Question One:** The Navajo's (Diné's) homelands hold enormous spiritual and cultural power. Their homelands—the Dinétah—are the foundation of generations of knowledge, practices, and teachings. When the Navajo (Diné) were uprooted from their homelands and forcibly marched to the internment camp Bosque Redondo, they suffered enormous loss and experienced horrific conditions at the hands of the United States government. U.S. officials tried to persuade the Navajo (Diné) to relocate to Indian Territory as an alternative to living at Bosque Redondo, but leaders of the Navajo (Diné) Nation refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured a return to their homelands.
- **Supporting Question Two:** The Navajo (Diné) faced incredible difficulty both in convincing the United States to allow them to reclaim their homelands and in the conditions they found there upon their return. The disparate power relations between the United States and the Navajo (Diné) make their journey home and subsequent renewal remarkable. While the 3.5-million-acre reservation recognized under the Treaty was a fraction of the Navajo's (Diné's) traditional tribal homelands, it set the stage for future actions by the Navajo (Diné) to resist and persist and gain back more of their lands in the nineteenth, twentieth and twenty-first centuries.

DO

Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay) that addresses why the Navajo (Diné) experience that led up to the 1868 Treaty and subsequent return to their homelands was so remarkable. Use specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources, while acknowledging competing views.

- **Supporting Question One:** Craft a claim about why it was critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home. First assess the actions of the United States against the Navajo (Diné) and then cite evidence about different ways the Navajo (Diné) demonstrated resolve to return home.
- **Supporting Question Two:** Craft an evidence-based claim about how the Navajo's (Diné's) return home sustains Navajo (Diné) culture for generations to come. First interpret the Treaty language and then make inferences about how the compromises the Navajo (Diné) were willing to make in order to return home shows agency.



Suggested Pacing Guide

Traditional Schedule:

Stage	Assessment Materials	Standards
Day 1 Staging the Question Supporting Question One	<u>Resolve</u>	<p>[C3] D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics . . . connected to human identities and cultures. D2.His.13.6-8. Evaluate the relevancy and utility of a historical source based on information . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p>
Day 2 Supporting Question Two	<p><u>Resource Annotator Example</u> <i>Teacher Tip: Students can save their annotations as a PDF for their summative task.</i></p> <p><u>Agency</u></p>	<p>[C3] D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics . . . connected to human identities and cultures. D2.Civ.3.6-8. Examine the origins, purposes, and impact of . . . treaties . . . D4.1.6-8. Construct arguments using claims and evidence . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports . . .</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p>
Day 3 Contemporary Connection Summative Performance Task	<p>Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? Construct an argument addressing the compelling question.</p>	<p>[C3] D1.5.6-8. Determining sources from multiple points of view . . . D4.1.6-8. Constructing evidence-based arguments from multiple sources . . .</p> <p>[CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1 Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content.</p> <p>[CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1 Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</p>
Extension 1-3 Days Taking Informed Action	<u>NK360° Framework for Taking Action</u>	<p>[C3] D4.7.6-8. Assess options for individual and collective action . . . D4.6.6-8. Draw on multiple disciplinary lenses. . .</p>

Block Schedule:

Stage	Assessment Materials	Standards
<p>Day 1 Staging the Question Supporting Question One</p>	<p><u>Resolve</u></p>	<p>[C3] D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics . . . connected to human identities and cultures. D2.His.13.6-8. Evaluate the relevancy and utility of a historical source based on information . . . [CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources. [CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p>
<p>Day 2 Supporting Question Two Summative Performance Task</p>	<p><u>Resource Annotator Example</u> <i>Teacher Tip: Students can save their annotations as a PDF for their summative task.</i> <u>Agency</u> Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? Construct an argument addressing the compelling question.</p>	<p>[C3] D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics . . . connected to human identities and cultures. D2.Civ.3.6-8. Examine the origins, purposes, and impact of . . . treaties . . . D4.1.6-8. Construct arguments using claims and evidence . . . [CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources. [CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely . . . CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims . . .</p> <p>[C3] D1.5.6-8. Determining sources from multiple points of view . . . D4.1.6-8. Constructing evidence-based arguments from multiple sources . . . [CCSS] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1 Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content. [CCSS Anchor Standards] CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1 Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</p>
<p>Extension Contemporary Connection, Taking Informed Action</p>	<p><u>NK360° Framework for Taking Action</u></p>	<p>[C3] D4.7.6-8. Assess options for individual and collective action . . . D4.6.6-8. Draw on multiple disciplinary lenses. . .</p>

Staging the Question Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

Teacher Tip: Before beginning the inquiry, students should have a basic understanding of treaties. Consider playing the **first thirty seconds** of the video [Let's Talk Treaties](#). This video features Native youth explaining in simple and accurate terms key facts that can help students understand the legal meaning of treaties. The entire video runs for a little over two minutes; if you chose to play the full video, there will be some sections that are not specific to the Navajo Treaty that students will investigate in this inquiry.

- What is a treaty? You might have students construct a definition for treaties and then expand on their definition later in the inquiry.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Teacher Tip: Resistance is a big idea in this inquiry. The following are suggestions for how you could help students transition from the concept of treaty making in general to establishing a context for the Navajo Treaty of 1868 and the theme of resistance. Below are four ideas for how students could brainstorm reasons why people, communities, and nations make sacrifices, plan resistance, and organize against oppression.

Option A—Mind Mapping

- You might have students brainstorm using a mind map. Students could use the word **resistance** as the central idea and then think of sub ideas that are associated with the big idea of resistance. Students might return to their mind map at the conclusion of the inquiry to see how their initial ideas about resistance may have changed.

Option B—Word Storming

- Consider helping students create a word storm about the big idea of **resistance**. Students first write down any word that comes to mind that is associated with the term resistance. Students could return to their word storms as they move through the inquiry in order to reflect on patterns or relationships they observe that are specific to the Navajo's (Diné's) journey home.

Option C—Visual Association

- One way students can brainstorm ideas about the theme of **resistance** is through a visual association. Students could preview an image that they will encounter in the inquiry that demonstrates an element of Navajo (Diné) resistance to actions by the United States.
- Direct students to the source set [Bosque Redondo](#). You might project the image "Blanket Weaver" and read the source's caption. Ask students to write down or share reasons why this image relates to the big idea of resistance. Alternatively, you could show students the image and the quote "Navajo (Diné) Leaders, Chief Barboncito's



Response to General Sherman” and ask how this source is an example of resistance against oppression.

Option D—Ask Questions

- Finally, you could have students raise questions they have about the big idea of **resistance**. Students might write their questions down, share with a peer, or discuss as a class. Patterns may emerge about what students associate with the idea of resistance and any questions they might need to address before beginning the inquiry.

***Teacher TIP:** Depending on your students’ needs and their familiarity with American Indian history and United States history, you might consider giving some context about the particular time and place this inquiry examines. This inquiry begins as the Navajo (Diné) Nation is waging an armed resistance against further incursion by white settlers and other tribes onto Navajo (Diné) homelands. Following the Mexican-American War and the signing of the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo in 1848, the United States was poised to take more lands and increase settlement in the Southwest. The Navajo (Diné), along with many other Native Nations, tenaciously defended their homelands, sovereignty, and culture. Students should keep in mind that this inquiry will offer Native perspectives about a troubling and painful chapter in United States history that created suffering, loss, and hardship. Yet, during an era in which so many Native Nations were forcibly removed from their homelands and were not able to return to the places to which they belonged, the Navajo (Diné) somehow found a way to go home.*

Check for Understanding

***Teacher TIP:** Before moving to supporting question one, consider conducting an informal assessment on the meaning of a treaty. Students should understand that treaties are legal agreements between nations. Article VI of the U.S. Constitution defines treaties between nations as the supreme law of the land, including treaties made between Native Nations and the United States government.*

Preview

- Stage the question by introducing the compelling question, *Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable?* In the next section, students will transition to supporting question one: *Why was it critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home?* You might have students preview the first supporting question by looking at a map of the United States and pointing out where the Navajo identify their homelands— in the area today known as the states of Colorado, New Mexico, and Arizona.

***Teacher Tip:** A map of Navajo (Diné) homelands is featured in supporting question one as an introduction in [Source Set A: The Long Walk](#).*

Supporting Question One: Why Was It Critical for the Navajo to Return Home?

Featured Sources

- **Source Set A:** *The Long Walk*—Assess the actions of the United States against the Navajo (Diné) before, during, and after the Long Walk to the Bosque Redondo Reservation.
- **Source Set B:** *Bosque Redondo*—Examine the ways in which the Navajo (Diné) exercised resistance, persistence, resilience, and negotiation in order to return home.

Student Tasks

- [Resolve](#)

Student Outcomes

KNOW:

During an era when many Native Nations found themselves forcibly removed from their homelands, the Navajo (Diné) also faced increasing pressure to leave their ancestral home. In the mid-1800s, the United States emerged as a nation driven to expand its territory west of the Mississippi. After many invasions by Spain, Mexico, and eventually the United States, the Navajo (Diné) mounted campaigns of resistance in order to remain in their ancestral homelands. With few choices, thousands of Navajo (Diné) were forced to march between 250 and 450 miles to the Bosque Redondo Reservation. They suffered enormous loss and horrific conditions during the Long Walk and while interned by the United States government. Despite enormous suffering and loss, Navajo (Diné) leaders successfully used the treaty-making process to return to their homelands.

UNDERSTAND:

Navajo (Diné) homelands hold enormous spiritual and cultural power. These homelands—the Dinétah—are the foundation of generations of knowledge, practices, and teachings. When the Navajo (Diné) were uprooted from their homelands and forcibly marched to the internment camp Bosque Redondo, they suffered enormous loss and experienced horrific conditions at the hands of the United States government. U.S. officials tried to persuade the Navajo (Diné) to relocate to Indian Territory as an alternative to living at Bosque Redondo, but leaders of the Navajo (Diné) Nation refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured a return to their homelands.

DO:

Craft a claim about why it was critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home. First assess the actions of the United States against the Navajo (Diné) and then cite evidence about different ways the Navajo (Diné) demonstrated resolve to return home.

Standards**[C3 Dimension Standards]**

D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics of places and regions are connected to human identities and cultures.

D2.His.13.6-8. Evaluate the relevancy and utility of a historical source based on information such as maker, date, place of origin, intended audience, and purpose.

[CCSS: 6-8 Grade Specific Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports an analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

Supporting Question One Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

- As a class, have students closely examine the introduction section of **Source Set A: The Long Walk**.
- Lead a discussion with students in which they cite the locations of the traditional Navajo (Diné) homelands and assess why these homelands are important to the Navajo (Diné).

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Part A—The Long Walk: Assess and Apply

Teacher TIP: The sources contained in the two source sets, *The Long Walk* and *Bosque Redondo*, reflect the harsh and often inhumane treatment the Navajo (Diné) received at the hands of the United States government. Prior to beginning these source sets with your students, you might discuss the sensitivity of this topic and its significance to developing a more complete understanding of United States history.

- Students can work individually, with partners, or in groups to analyze the source set. First, students review the sources, captions, and discussion questions in *Source Set A*. Next, in the column “U.S. Actions,” they assess how the U.S. violated Navajo (Diné) human rights and provide evidence from the source set about U.S. actions. Then, students apply how that action would be a violation of human rights.
- Discuss with students the consequences of violating human rights. Consider asking whether the United States government faced accountability for its actions.

Teacher TIP: If your students are unfamiliar with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, you may need to allocate time to preview this content. You can also opt to speak more generally about the concept of human rights and ask students to consider what rights all people should have because they are part of the human community.

Part B—Navajo (Diné) Resolve: Cite Evidence

Working as a class, with partners, or in groups, students cite evidence from **Source Set B: Bosque Redondo** that demonstrates how the Navajo (Diné) exercised resolve by using resistance, persistence, resilience, and negotiation.

Teacher TIP: Remind students to think about the discussion questions that accompany each source. The discussion questions seek to elicit key ideas about how the Navajo (Diné) exercised resolve before, during, and after their internment at Bosque Redondo.

Teacher TIP: This graphic organizer represents evidence that students might use to explain how the Navajo exercised different forms of resolve while interned at Bosque Redondo.

How Did They Do It?	Evidence
Resistance	Navajo leaders resisted U.S. efforts to remove their people to a reservation in Indian Territory.
Persistence	Chief Barboncito continued to stand up to the U.S. each time he spoke out about the horrible conditions at Bosque Redondo.
Resilience	Navajo women used their knowledge of weaving to continue parts of the culture even while they were interned at Bosque Redondo.
Negotiation	Navajo women pleaded with U.S. commissioners and helped to negotiate a treaty between the U.S. and the Navajo Nation.

Check for Understanding

Part C—Coming to Conclusions

- Now that students have reviewed both source sets, they are ready to come to some conclusions about why it was critical for the Navajo (Diné) to return home. In Part C—Coming to Conclusions, students craft a claim and use evidence about why the Navajo (Diné) maintained the resolve to return home.
- Check for understanding about why it was critical that the Navajo (Diné) return home: Navajo (Diné) homelands hold enormous spiritual and cultural power. These homelands—the Dinétah—are the foundation of generations of knowledge, practices, and teachings. When the Navajo (Diné) were uprooted from their homelands and forcibly marched to the internment camp Bosque Redondo, they suffered enormous loss and experienced horrific conditions at the hands of the United States government. U.S. officials tried to persuade the Navajo (Diné) to relocate to Indian Territory as an alternative to living at Bosque Redondo, but leaders of the Navajo (Diné) Nation refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured a return to their homelands.
- In supporting question two, students will consider how agency on the part of Navajo (Diné) leaders and citizens—demonstrated through negotiation of challenging compromises and incredible persistence—allowed them to sustain their culture across generations.

Supporting Question Two: How Did the Navajo’s Return Home Sustain Their Culture for Generations to Come?

Featured Sources

- **Source Set A:** *The Navajo Treaty of 1868*—Analyze the language of the Navajo Treaty of 1868 and consider the difficult compromises Navajo (Diné) leaders were willing to make in order to return home.
- **Source Set B:** *The Return Home*—Consider how the Navajo’s (Diné’s) return home sustains Navajo (Diné) culture for generations to come and shows agency on part of Navajo (Diné) Peoples in the past and today.

Student Tasks

- **Resource Annotator Example**—This supporting question includes an interactive resource annotator. Students use the annotator tool to mark up treaty articles from the Navajo Treaty of 1868. They can use up to five pins per treaty article to make notes that support the theme of **compromise**.
- **Agency**



Student Outcomes

KNOW

For the Navajo (Diné) the 1868 Treaty allowed a return to their ancestral homelands (Dinétah) and is important to Navajo (Diné) sovereignty. However, the Treaty also required Navajo (Diné) leaders to make difficult compromises. The Treaty stipulated compulsory schooling for Navajo (Diné) children, allowance of railroads to pass through Navajo (Diné) lands, and an assurance from the Navajo (Diné) that they would not harm wagon trains or cattle crossing their lands. The Navajo’s (Diné’s) return to home was not without challenge or sacrifice. Not only did they have to rebuild their homelands from the scorched-earth campaigns waged by the United States, but they also faced the challenge of sustaining their culture for future generations.

UNDERSTAND

The Navajo (Diné) faced incredible difficulty both in convincing the United States to allow them to reclaim their homelands and in the conditions they found there upon their return. The disparate power relations between the United States and the Navajo (Diné) make their journey home and subsequent renewal remarkable. While the 3.5-million-acre reservation recognized under the Treaty was a fraction of the Navajo’s (Diné’s) traditional tribal homelands, it set the stage for future actions by the Navajo (Diné) to resist and persist and gain back more of their lands in the nineteenth, twentieth, and twenty-first centuries.

DO

Craft an evidence-based claim about how the Navajo’s (Diné’s) return home sustains Navajo (Diné) culture for generations to come: first interpret Treaty language and then make inferences about the compromises the Navajo (Diné) were willing to make in order to return home shows agency.

Standards**[C3 Dimension Standards]**

D2.Geo.6.6-8. Explain how the physical and human characteristics of places and regions are connected to human identities and cultures.

D2.Civ.3.6-8. Examine the origins, purposes, and impact of constitutions, laws, treaties, and international agreements

D4.1.6-8. Construct arguments using claims and evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging the strengths and limitations of the arguments.

[CCSS: 6-8 Grade Specific Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.6.1: Cite textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.8.1: Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports an analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1.B: Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standards]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1: Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

Supporting Question Two Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

- Ask students what compromises they have had to make and why they made them. Were they easy to make?
- To what extent were they satisfied with the outcome? Why/why not?
- Discuss with students whether engaging in compromise helps or hurts an individual or a group's chance of finding success during difficult situations.

Review

- Recall with students the incredible challenges the Navajo (Diné) faced while interned at Bosque Redondo. Remind students of the importance of resolve. Students might revisit the evidence they cited in Part B on the student worksheet **Resolve** that showed how the Navajo (Diné) exercised resolve by using resistance, persistence, resilience, and negotiation.
- Students should keep these ideas in mind as they examine the sources in supporting question two.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Formative Assessment

Part A—The Treaty: Interpret Meaning

Teacher TIP: Students can work independently, with a partner, or in small groups to complete the tasks associated with each source set.

- **Source Set A—The Navajo Treaty of 1868** features five treaty articles. Students do not need to analyze all treaty articles. Rather, they will select three to summarize, interpret, and apply.
- In Part A on the student worksheet **Agency** students select three treaty articles that demonstrate a difficult compromise the Navajo (Diné) were willing to make in order to return home. Students can also use the **annotator tool** to highlight examples by explaining why a treaty article shows evidence of a difficult compromise for the Navajo.
- For each article, students should list what the article says (summarize), determine what the article means (interpret), and finally, decide why the article matters (apply) to Navajo (Diné) culture and sovereignty.

Teacher TIP: Students might struggle with the assimilation-heavy terms of the 1868 Treaty and what they have learned about Navajo (Diné) resolve to push against U.S. efforts to diminish Navajo (Diné) culture and sovereignty. This tension speaks to the incredibly difficult choices that leaders of nations must make in extraordinary times. When a person or group is backed against a corner, as the Navajo (Diné) were in 1868, how can they exercise agency if one individual or group clearly has more power? Encourage students to think about compromise as one way in which nations can strategize to achieve success in the long term, even if it requires sacrifice in the short term.

Part B—Returning Home: Making Inferences

- In Part B, students should be prepared to make three inferences about how the compromises that the Navajo (Diné) were willing to make helped them sustain their culture for future generations.

Teacher TIP: An inference is a conclusion reached on the basis of evidence and reasoning. Remind students to refer to the sources and captions as evidence and use the discussion questions to support their reasoning.

Part C—Crafting Evidence-Based Claims

- Remind students that to craft an evidence-based claim requires careful review of the sources and consideration of the skills they've practiced thus far (interpretation, application, and inference making). In Part C on the student worksheet ***Agency***, students craft an evidence-based claim about how the Navajo's (Diné's) return home showed agency and has sustained Navajo (Diné) culture for many generations.

Check for Understanding

- The Navajo (Diné) faced incredible difficulty both in convincing the United States to allow them to reclaim their homelands and in the conditions they found there upon their return. The disparate power relations between the United States and the Navajo (Diné) makes their journey home and subsequent renewal remarkable. While the 3.5-million-acre reservation recognized under the treaty was a fraction of the Navajo's (Diné's) traditional tribal homelands, it set the stage for future actions by the Navajo (Diné) to resist and persist and gain back more of their lands in the nineteenth, twentieth, and twenty-first centuries.

Summative Performance Task

Student Tasks

- **Summative Performance Task: Evidence Kit**—Build an evidence kit by selecting up to five sources that support your argument about why the Navajo (Diné) journey home was so remarkable.

Student Outcomes

KNOW

The Navajo's (Diné's) ancestral homelands, the Dinétah, are the foundation of generations of knowledge about the land and cultural practices. In 1863, the United States government forcibly removed the Navajo (Diné) from their homelands and interned them at the Bosque Redondo Reservation. During their internment, the Navajo (Diné) endured miserable conditions, which led to enormous suffering and death. As U.S. officials began to realize that they could not sustain the reservation, they tried to persuade Navajo (Diné) leaders to relocate to Indian Territory. However, Navajo (Diné) leaders and community members refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured their return to a portion of their homelands and resources to help them rebuild. The 1868 Treaty, however, required difficult compromises from Navajo (Diné) Peoples. Upon returning to their homelands, the Navajo (Diné) faced an enormous challenge to renew and rebuild their lands. Today, the Navajo (Diné) Nation continues to find ways to secure and sustain the abundance of lands and reaffirm their culture.

UNDERSTAND

The Navajo's (Diné's) journey home demonstrated incredible leadership and agency on the part of the Navajo (Diné) Nation. From fighting against incursions on their homelands by white settlers, to demonstrating strength during the Long Walk and while interned at Bosque Redondo, community members maintained an unflinching resolve to return home. With persistence, determination, and negotiation, Navajo (Diné) leaders successfully negotiated with U.S. officials and secured the rights to return to their ancestral homelands.

DO

Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable? Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay) that addresses why the Navajo (Diné) experience that led up to the 1868 Treaty and subsequent return to their homelands was so remarkable. Use specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources, while acknowledging competing views.

Standards**[C3 Dimension Standards]**

D1.5.6-8. Determine the kinds of sources that will be helpful in answering compelling and supporting questions, taking into consideration multiple points of views represented in the sources.

D4.1.6-8. Construct arguments using claims and evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging the strengths and limitations of the arguments.

[CCSS: 6-8 Grade Specific Standard]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.6-8.1 Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

[CCSS: Corresponding Anchor Standard]

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

Summative Performance Task

Lesson Procedures

Anticipatory Set

- Return to the compelling question: Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable?
- You might briefly revisit the two supporting questions with students to refresh their understanding of key content and concepts.
- Students could reflect on the extent to which their understanding of the compelling question might have changed as they moved through the inquiry.

Guided Practice, Instruction, and Summative Assessment

- At this point in the inquiry, students have examined sources that convey the challenges the Navajo (Diné) faced in convincing the U.S. to allow them to reclaim their homelands (Dinètah) as well as in the conditions they found there upon their return home. The Navajo (Diné) came very close to being ordered to permanently remove to Indian Territory rather than return to their home. Students should recognize that the persistence, agency, and negotiation of incredibly difficult choices displayed by the Navajo (Diné) all contributed to why and how they were able to return home.
- Students should be expected to demonstrate the breadth of their understandings and their abilities to use evidence from multiple sources to support their claims and refute counterclaims. In this task, students construct an evidence-based argument using multiple sources to answer the compelling question: Why was the Navajo (Diné) journey home so remarkable?

Summative Argument

- It is important to note that students' arguments could take a variety of forms, including a detailed outline, graphic, presentation, or essay. Students should construct an argument in one of these forms that addresses the compelling question and acknowledges competing views, using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical sources.
- Students' arguments will vary but could include any of the argument stems presented below. Note that students should support their arguments with specific evidence from the sources they examined in the inquiry and be prepared to acknowledge competing claims or counterarguments.

Argument Stems

Teacher TIP: An argument stem serves as the thesis statement for students' arguments.

- **Leadership and agency:** The Navajo's (Diné's) journey home was remarkable because it demonstrated incredible leadership and agency on the part of the Navajo (Diné) Nation. In 1864, the United States government forcibly removed the Navajo (Diné) from their homelands. The forced march to the internment camp, Bosque Redondo, led to suffering and death for the Navajo. Once interned at Bosque Redondo, leaders of the Navajo (Diné)

Nation continued to find ways to take care of their people and look for ways to return home. Facing reports on the appalling conditions at Bosque Redondo and realizing that they could not sustain the camp, U.S. officials tried to get the Navajo (Diné) to relocate to Indian Territory. However, Navajo (Diné) leaders and community members insisted that they be able to return home. Through persistence, determination, and negotiation, Navajo (Diné) leaders successfully negotiated with U.S. officials and secured in the 1868 Treaty the rights to return to their ancestral homelands. Returning home afforded spiritual and cultural strength to the Navajo (Diné), which will allow for teachings to continue for generations to come.

- **Returning to sacred homelands:** The Navajo's (Diné's) journey home was remarkable because the Navajo (Diné) were able to return to a place that held enormous spiritual and cultural power. Their homelands—the Dinétah—are the foundation of generations of knowledge, practices, and teachings. When the Navajo (Diné) were uprooted from their homelands and forcibly marched to the internment camp Bosque Redondo, they suffered enormous loss and experienced horrific conditions at the hands of the United States government. U.S. officials tried to persuade the Navajo (Diné) to relocate to Indian Territory as an alternative to living at Bosque Redondo, but leaders of the Navajo (Diné) Nation refused and were able to negotiate a Treaty in 1868 with the United States that secured a return to their homelands. To be reunited with their homelands meant having access to the places that hold cultural and spiritual significance.
- **Renew and rebuild:** The Navajo's (Diné's) journey home was remarkable because it shows how a nation and people can renew and rebuild from suffering and hardship. Navajo (Diné) leaders and community members were fiercely determined to return home. Even after being forcibly removed from their homelands and enduring a long march to the internment camp Bosque Redondo, the Navajo (Diné) did not give up. Navajo (Diné) leaders used the treaty-making process to secure a return to their homelands and forge a nation-to-nation relationship with the United States government. By signing the Treaty, the Navajo (Diné) Nation agreed to cease war against the United States, allow U.S. officials to live within their lands and oversee their obligations to the Navajo (Diné), and permit the construction of railroads through their lands. Some Navajo (Diné) leaders and community members even agreed to send their children to American schools, despite the risk that the children might lose cultural values and teachings. However, because the Treaty stated that the Navajo (Diné) Nation would return to its homelands, it meant that the Navajo (Diné) could rebuild and restore their nation in the ancestral homelands to which they belonged. Today the Navajo (Diné) still look to and celebrate the Treaty as a critical step to affirming their sovereignty and rights to self-determination.

Contemporary Connections

Featured Sources

- **Case Study:** Navajo (Diné) Nation Homelands Today— See how the Navajo (Diné) Nation continues to find ways to secure and sustain its homelands for future generations.

Student Tasks

- **Optional Student Planning Extension:** [*NK360° Framework for Taking Informed Action*](#)

Student Outcomes

KNOW

Native People, communities, organizations, and nations take informed action to mediate social and political issues.

UNDERSTAND

The unique characteristics and challenges of reaffirming tribal sovereignty and how the Navajo (Diné) Nation continues to find ways to secure and sustain its homelands.

DO

Identify, describe, and infer the characteristics of community organizing and how Native Nations organize to celebrate and sustain native cultures.

Standards

Contemporary Connection

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D4.7.6-8. Assess their individual and collective capacities to take action to address local, regional, and global problems, taking into account a range of possible levers of power, strategies, and potential outcomes.

D4.6.6-8. Draw on multiple disciplinary lenses to analyze how a specific problem can manifest itself at local, regional, and global levels over time, identifying its characteristics and causes, and the challenges and opportunities faced by those trying to address the problem.

Extension Taking Informed Action

[C3 Dimension Standards]

D4.7.6-8. Assess their individual and collective capacities to take action to address local, regional, and global problems, taking into account a range of possible levers of power, strategies, and potential outcomes

D4.8.6-8. Apply a range of deliberative and democratic procedures to make decisions and take action in their classrooms and schools, and in out-of-school civic contexts.

Contemporary Connections

Featured Sources

- **Case Study: Navajo (Diné) Nation Homelands Today**— See how the Navajo (Diné) Nation continues to find ways to secure and sustain its homelands for future generations.

Student Task

- Optional Student Planning Extension: [NK360° Framework for Taking Informed Action](#)

Anticipatory Set

- Ask students what the word *agency* means (*agency* means the ability to act or use power).
- As needed, help students define the word in their own terms. Students might brainstorm examples of agency in their own lives.
- Transition to the concept of agency as it relates to this inquiry. While the Navajo (Diné) did make concessions in an effort to return to their homelands and the 3.5-million-acre reservation recognized under the Treaty was only a fraction of the Navajo's (Diné's) traditional tribal homelands, the Navajo (Diné) have always desired to gain back more of their lands.
- Over time, the Navajo (Diné) expanded the treaty-prescribed boundaries, and today the nation encompasses about 17 million acres of land in northwestern New Mexico, northeastern Arizona, and southeastern Utah, making it the largest reservation in the United States.

Guided Practice and Optional Expository Writing

- Explain to students that one way in which we can see Navajo (Diné) agency at work is the purchase of two large ranches in Colorado. This land purchase brings the Navajo (Diné) Nation closer to two of its sacred mountains, Blanca Peak and Hesperus Mountain.
- Direct students to the contemporary-connections case study, *Navajo (Diné) Nation Homelands Today*.
- After examining the image, reading the supporting quote, and considering the discussion questions, students might complete an expository-writing sample about the significance of the land purchase to sustaining Navajo (Diné) sovereignty and culture for future generations.